Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System via Cooperation of University - Business - Government in HEIs

EDUQAS

WP3 Capacity Building: Implementation of internal QA systems

Part 1. Report on QA Unit analysis and recommendation

KAZAKH UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS, FINANCE AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE

Baiba Šavriņa, Māris Purgailis, Latvijas Universitāte (Riga, Latvia)
Cedric Sanlis, Charles Ris, Universite de Lorraine (Nancy Cedex, France)
OleksandrZhadanos, Oleg Potap, National Metallurgical Academy of Ukraine (Dnipro, Ukraine)
Pavlo Horyslavets, Lviv Polytechnic National University (Lviv, Ukraine)
Tansholpan Abdigappar, Kazakh Ablai khan University of International Relations and World Languages (Almaty, Kazakhstan)
Nataliia Stukalo, National Agency For Higher Education Quality Assurance (Kyiv, Ukraine)

May 2020

QA Unit		
Does the QA Unit exist ?		
Yes		
What is the line of authority ?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
Quality assurance and strategic analysis department was created by restructuring the quality control department 19.10.2018	*- Department has already existed.* *- The QAD department reports directly to the rector, which gives him the opportunity to give active support while performing his functions.* *The creation of the department on the basis of an existing structure allowed it to easily fit into the existing system of interaction between structural divisions.*	
Recommendations:		
How is it structured?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
QA department's staff consists of three full time specialists (the head, chief specialist and leading specialist) and two part time specialists.	*-The structure of QAD covers all necessary quality assurance directions (internal and external).* *-The structure of QAD is clear and transparent.*	*Low number of personnel leads to their overload of duties.*
Recommendations: *To involve representatives of chairs to participate of working the QAD.*		
What are the skills of the staff attached to it?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
Requirements for employees are regulated by job descriptions.	*The qualifications of the staff comply with the job descriptions. The staff is constantly improving their skills (trainings, seminars, continuing education courses).* *The department has experience in cooperation in the field of quality assurance both with international accreditation agencies (FIBBA) and with the relevant agencies of the Republic of Kazakhstan (IAAR).*	*Low number of personnel leads to their overload of duties.*
Recommendations: *To define clearly the responsibilities of each staff member involved in the QA procedures.*		

Has the mission been defined? How? By whom? What ?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
The mission is clearly defined as "Realization of Policy and goals of KazUEFIT in the field of quality and strategic analysis."	*The purpose and tasks of the department are fully consistent with European practices to ensure the quality of educational activities.*	

Recommendations :
To evaluate the content and relevance of the mission and review them once every 3-5 years

Have the aims been defined? How? By whom? What ?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
• *The main objectives of the department are:* • *Implementation of the Policy and goals of KazUEFMT in the field of quality and strategic analysis.* • *Search for ways to effectively use the resources of the University, to increase them in the interest of improving the quality of education.* • *Information and methodological support for accreditation of the University and individual educational programs.* • *Organization and implementation of activities aimed at continuous improvement and improvement of the functioning of the quality management system.* • *Preparation of internal documents necessary for the implementation of the University's strategy.* • *Carrying out monitoring*	*The purpose and tasks of the department are fully consistent with European practices to ensure the quality of educational activities.*	

studies.		

Recommendations: To clarify faculties' and departments' duties during the process of study programs development.

What human and material resources are at its disposal? Number of HR? Local? Hardware? Software ?		
Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
QA department's staff consists of three full time specialists (the head, chief specialist and leading specialist) and two part time specialists. The QAIDD has own office with sufficient working stations and necessary equipment (e.g. computers) and software (e.g.platforms for survey conducts)	The department is provided with the necessary premises, equipment and software (e.g.platforms for survey conducts). Staff has extensive experience in collecting the necessary information and its analytical feedback.	Low number of personnel leads to their overload of duties.

Recommendations:
It is advisable to assign some responsibilities to the teaching staff that provides the educational program, for example, questioning students about the level of satisfaction with their disciplines, the educational program as a whole, as well as analyzing these profiles.

What links, tools and procedures are in place to collect qualitative and quantitative information ?		
Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The following survey methods are used: oral survey, filling out printed questionnaires, Google forms. Also department uses the university Information system for tracking and analytics of students in DLT (Information system for tracking and analytics of students in DLT).	Existence of procedures for collecting and analysing information	Lack of wider availability of the results of surveys

Recommendations:
It is necessary to publish information on the official website of the university about the analysis of the results of surveys of stakeholders and reactions to the opinion of stakeholders on improving educational programs and the internal quality assurance system. This will promote openness and

transparency.

QA System

Does a QA System exist?
Yes

Does the quality strategy of the university exist? And which link with the QA Unit ?		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
*Quality strategy of the University partly exists as a component of University mission (*https://kuef.kz/ru/about/mission/ *The quality policy regulated by the next main documents:* • *Development Strategy of KazUEFIT.* • *Academic policy of KazUEFIT.* • *Anti-corruption policy of KazUEFIT.* • *The code of honor of the student and teacher of KazUEFIT.*	*Well-established interaction between the main structural units responsible for ensuring the quality of education.* *The quality policy covers all necessary areas.*	
Recommendations:		

Do collaboration procedures exist with the following services (if they do exist) :		
Student office		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
The Youth Committee is actively integrated into the educational system and works closely with the Student council.	1. *The Youth Committee is actively involved into the educational system.* 2. *There are 37 amateur student's clubs at university which allows students to develop soft skills.* 3. *The student service center accepts applications for the provision of services and advises students on academic issues. The main goal of the Student Service Center is to provide*	1. *Lack of active participation of students in the procedures of periodically reviewing educational programs.*

	qualitative and quick service to students on the basis of a "one-stop shop"	

Recommendations:
More actively involve students in the procedures of periodically reviewing educational programs.
Student government bodies can help students increase their awareness of non-formal education, and conflict resolution.

International office

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The international office (https://kuef.kz/ru/cooperation/) carries out the following functions: • Development of cooperation at the national and international levels with universities and educational organizations; • Management of inbound and outbound academic mobility; • Development and management of international projects; • Management of joint educational programs and double degree programs; • Recruiting and adaptation of foreign students; • Development of internationalization in KazUEFMT.	• The international office actively contributes to the implementation of such areas of the university as international projects, double diploma programs, academic mobility, international ratings and accreditations.	1. Some teachers and students have a lack of language training. 2. The information for foreign applicants on homepage of KazUEFMT (https://kuef.kz/en/cooperation/inostrannym-abiturientam/) is fully in Russian

Recommendations:
1. *It is necessary to enhance the language training of students and teachers for larger possibilities of international cooperation and mobility*
2. *It is necessary to develop the internationalization of the KazUEFMT to attract foreign students, to provide the information in English on homepage*

Alumni office

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The Career Centre (https://kuef.kz/ru/career/) assists students in internships and graduates in finding employment or creating their own business. The Centre oversees issues of interaction with the alumni association. One of the directions of Centre activity is cooperation with	• To commercialize the start-up projects of students, undergraduates, doctoral study programs students of University, a Youth Business Incubator was	Publications of young researchers (https://kuef.kz/en/science/collection/) in Russian only

employers by following questions: participating in university job fairs, conducting guest lectures, seminars, trainings, master classes and meetings with students and graduates of the university, participation in scientific conferences, including in student conferences, as well as in seminars and round tables held at the university, improving the educational programs of the university, advanced training of teachers on specific issues of the development of an industry or economic sphere	*created in the structure of the Career Centre.* • *The Centre also oversees issues of interaction with the alumni association.*	

Recommendations :
1. *To invite alumni association to participate in the activities of Youth Business Incubator which was created within the structure of the Career Centre.*
2. *To develop the publication possibilities for young researchers in English*

Office of relations with the professional sector

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The Career Centre is responsible for this direction.	1. *Strong relationship with banks and Institute of Economy (Ministry of economy of Kazakhstan)* 2. *Involvement of finance professionals in teaching activities* 3. *Youth Business Incubator was created within the structure of the Career Centre*	*Remuneration gap in between finance sector and HEI for involvement of employers in teaching activities*

Recommendations : to continue the development of non-formal education system for professionals and for students in addition to regular activities of contribution to employment of students and graduates

Business Intelligence office – Statistics and survey

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
Quality assurance and strategic analysis department and Career Centre are responsible for this	*Data is collected via surveys*	*Low number of personnel leads to their overload of duties.*

direction.		

Recommendations :
Attract senior students to the collection and analysis of information, which will contribute to the development of analytical skills, the ability to collect and analyse statistical information.

Assessment support

How does the QA Unit support programmatic evaluations?

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
According to the defined tasks of the QA Unit: *-Information and methodological support of the university accreditation and individual educational programs;* *-Analysis of compliance of the University activity with requirements of quality guidelines;* *- Coordination of university performance and preparation of documents for participation in the ratings (institutional and on individual educational programs)* *- Organization and conduct of monitoring studies of stakeholder satisfaction with quality of education at the university, investigation of requirements and needs.*	*The quality department accompanies the process of internal evaluation of the quality of the educational programs corresponding to the audit procedure of the EP in accordance with the "Regulation on the Audit of Educational Programs".*	*It is necessary to publish information on the official website of the university about the internal evaluation of educational programs. This will promote openness and transparency.*

Recommendations:(also see previous)
To publish information on the official website of the university about the internal evaluation of educational programs. This will promote openness and transparency.

What tools are being developed to support the collation of information useful for program evaluation?

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
Diversity of links with students, graduates and different people involved in the program, surveys, etc.	*1. The tools do exist (e.g. surveys...)*	1. *There is not enough public information about the analysis of the results of surveys of stakeholders and the reaction to the opinion of stakeholders on*

		improving educational programs and the internal quality assurance system.
Recommendations : It is necessary to publish information on the official website of the university about the analysis of the results of surveys of stakeholders and reactions to the opinion of stakeholders on improving educational programs and the internal quality assurance system. This will promote openness and transparency.		

How the QA Unit supports the collecting and analysis of information on :		
Improvement on Quality of education programmes (ESG 1.2)		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
Improvement of the quality of educational programs is performed through internal quality assurance mechanisms: • *Internal audits by commissions of various areas (educational process, educational-methodical and research work, etc.)* • *Surveys of stakeholders (students, academic staff, employers, graduates)* • *Assessment of students' residual knowledge and comparison with the results of the session,* • *Development of recommendations for improving educational programs, implementing the recommendations received and monitoring of its implementation.*	*The internal QA system has the necessary structure and procedures of collection and analysis of information.*	*Feedback about implementation of recommendations can be better provided to students and stakeholders*
Recommendations: To develop the system of how the feedback about the implementation of recommendations will be regularly provided to all stakeholders		
Teaching and learning methods (Students centered learning, motivation of student, teaching innovations) (ESG 1.3)		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
The main types of training at the EP are lectures, seminars, individual	*Multimedia software and interactive methods increases the*	*The distance learning system is mainly intended for part-time students.*

lessons, consultations, workshops. Both the traditional teaching methods and techniques, and innovative technologies are applied: personality-oriented learning; learning as research; group project training; training, game, interactive techniques.	effectiveness of learning.	Interactive methods of training, teamwork and especially project-based methods are not sufficiently used for bachelor's students.

Recommendations:
1. *Continue to diversify learning methods including interactive methods of training, teamwork and especially project-based methods.*
2. *Continue to develop a distance learning system.*

Students : admission, progress, certification, form of examination (ESG 1.4)

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
Admission, progress, certification, form of examination for students are regulated by following documents: • Rules for admission for educational programs of higher education (postgraduate education) • Regulation on final certification of students of undergraduate programs (postgraduate education) • Regulation on development and implementation of double-degree education programs and joint educational programs in KazUEFIT.	• Presence of normative documents regulating the organization of the educational process and admission to the University.	The students are not involved enough in the elaboration of study programs, they are not aware enough of their rights, role and possibilities in academic life.

Recommendations:
1. *Pay more attention to the non-academic life of students, give them more opportunities to develop their additional skills, help them organize an active student life.*
2. *To strengthen the participation of students in the processes of improving the educational program.*
3. *Promote students' awareness of the opportunities offered by non-formal education.*
4. *To pay more attention to students' awareness of conflict resolution procedures and exam results appeals.*
5. *To make curriculum and brief content of educational programs accessible to entrants.*

Staff skills and development (ESG 1.5)

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The procedures associated with the selection of teachers, their advanced training, motivation are governed by regulations developed at the university: • Rules of internal labor regulations and corporate ethics in KazUEFIT • Regulation on assessment system of academic staff of the University • Guide on work with Moodle portal • Regulation on academic mobility of students and academic staff of KazUEFIT	1. Highly motivated and high-quality teaching staff who can work in difficult conditions. 2. Teaching staff regularly participate in advanced trainings in various forms: webinars, online courses, workshops. 3. Teachers have possibilities to have foreign experience (internships in GB, USA, EU). 4. Pedagogical performance is regularly evaluated by students during the survey. 5. To enhance professionalism, motivation and stimulation of the teaching staff the university applies the system of rewarding of the teaching staff with bonus for their contribution and achievements in the professional and research activities. There is also a budget for increasing the staff qualification and grants for the best teachers.	1. Insufficient knowledge of foreign languages among teaching staff 2. Publications of young researchers (https://kuef.kz/en/science/collection/) in Russian only

Recommendations:
1. Given the large gap in salaries between the financial and educational sectors, to think over additional measures of social protection for teaching staff
2. To develop the system of foreign language courses for teaching staff.
3. To develop the possibilities for young researchers to present their research results in English in KazUEFIT conferences (and to publish corresponding conference proceedings)

Resources for student learning and support (libraries, IT infrastructure, etc.) (ESG 1.6)

Describe the process	Strengths	Weaknesses
The university has all the necessary material and technical resources to ensure student learning	• The student service center accepts applications for the provision of services	The distance learning system is mainly intended for part-time students.

including necessary equipment, library, students dormitory, e-learning portal.	*and advises students on academic issues. The main goal of the Student Service Center is to provide a qualitative and quick service to students on the basis of a "one-stop shop";* • *Developed E-learning portal;* • *Library funds are available electronically. Funds are regularly replenished with new literature;* • *The presence of a well-developed and technically secure information-analytical system for managing the educational process.* • *There are good conditions in dormitory. Every day at 7:30 a.m and 12:30 p.m bus delivers students from the dormitory to the university for free.* • *There are 37 amateur clubs at university which allows developing soft skills.*	

Recommendations : *More actively use the distance learning system for full-time students.*		
Business intelligence (ESG 1.7)		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
There is a mechanism for managing information about the students(contingent, payment, contingent movement, students successfulness, students surveys); employment of graduates, graduates surveys.	*The presence of a powerful information system for tracking and analytics of students (contingent, payment, contingent movement, orders, employment, summary reports) allows to collect and analyze necessary indicators.*	*Low number of personnel leads to their overload of duties.*

Recommendations :
Attract senior students to the process of collection and analysis of information, which will contribute to their development of analytical skills, the ability to collect and analyse statistical information.

Public information (ESG 1.8)		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
Openness and transparency of information provide: • *Regulations on the official site of KazUEFIT;* • *Regulation on organization and conduct of the video contest "I choose KazUEFIT";* • *Regulations on branches of departments.*	*The access to the necessary documents is ensured through their placement on the University's website.*	*Lack of information on curricula and content of educational programs on the University website.*

Recommendations :

To publish a short content of the curriculum and the qualification characteristics of the specialties on the web-site, so that they are accessible to all who are interested.
To provide syllabuses in open access in a simplified edition - to make the information clearer for students.

Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluations (ESG 1.9)		
Describe the process	*Strengths*	*Weaknesses*
Continuous monitoring and periodic evaluations defined by the following regulations: • *Regulation on audit of educational programs;* • *Regulation for assessment system of students' performance on mastering modular educational programs;* • *Documented procedures for educational programs and educational work.* *A pilot evaluation of two programmes was carried out under EDUQUAS.*	*The presence of clearly developed and working procedures for continuous monitoring and periodic audit of educational programs.* *The success of the university in this direction is confirmed by the successful accreditation of educational programs by both national and foreign accreditation agencies.*	*Feedback about implementation of recommendations can be better provided to students and stakeholders*

Recommendations :
1. To strengthen the participation of students in the processes of improving the educational

programs.