



Co-funded by the Erasmus+ Programme of the Europen Union

Quality report in the context of WP4

Implementation of Education Quality Assurance system via cooperation of University-Business-Government in HEIs 586109-EPP-1-2017-1-RO-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP-EDUQAS



web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas



facebook.com/EDUQASErasmus





This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the authors and contributors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

About the project ERASMUS+ EDUQAS "Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System via Cooperation of University- Business-Government in HEIs"

The wider objective of the project is to improve education quality assurance systems through development of efficient internal quality standards leading to better employability of students in Partner Countries Universities. The internal QA system is based on analysis of needs and capacities in Kazakh and Ukrainian HEIs, experiences and best practices from the successful quality assurance action line of the Bologna Process.

Main goals:

• to promote the creation of quality culture at various levels through motivation, trust, responsibility of students, institutional leadership, individual staff members;

• to elaborate proposals for the design of programmes on Bachelor and Master levels with the involvement of all stakeholders;

• to develop technologies of assessment quality of Bachelor and Master programmes; designed programmes should meet the objectives including learning outcomes;

- to conduct training for the QA specialist and academic staff;
- to improve affiliate network university-business-government, collaboration with the EU universities;
- to enhance internal university information systems of quality evaluation;
- to develop a corporate QA infrastructure based on ICT, on-line, mobile technologies.

Partnership:

- > P1 UNIVERSITATEA DIN CRAIOVA, Craiova, Romania Project coordinator
- > P2 KUNGLIGA TEKNISKA HOEGSKOLAN, Stockolm, Sweden
- > P3 UNIVERSITE DE LIEGE, Liege, Belgium
- > P4 UNIVERSITY OF PLOVDIV PAISII HILENDARSKI, Plovdiv, Bulgaria
- ▶ P5 LATVIJAS UNIVERSITATE, Riga, Latvia
- > P6 UNIVERSITE DE LORRAINE, Nancy Cedex, France
- > P7 SIMON KUZNETS KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS, Kharkiv, Ukraine
- > P8 LVIV POLYTECHNIC NATIONAL UNIVERSITY, Lviv, Ukraine
- > P9 DONETSK STATE UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT, Mariupil, Ukraine
- > P10 NATIONAL METALLURGICAL ACADEMY OF UKRAINE, Dnipropetrovsk, Ukraine
- P11 ABLAI KHAN UNIVERSITY OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND WORLD LANGUAGES, Almaty, Kazakhstan
- P12 KAZAKH UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMY, FINANCE AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE, Astana, Kazakhstan
- > P13 INSTITUTE OF HIGHER EDUCATION, NATIONAL ACADEMY OF EDUCATION, Kyiv, Ukraine
- > P14 NATIONAL AGENCY FOR HIGHER EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE, Kyiv, Ukraine
- > P15 MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF UKRAINE, Kyiv, Ukraine
- > P16 MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE, Astana, Kazakhstan
- P17 HAUT CONSEIL DE L'EVALUATION DE LA RECHERCHE ET DE L'ENSEIGNEMENT, Paris, France

EXTERNAL EVALUATION REPORT

Erasmus+ Project

Key action 2: Capacity Building in higher education Project number: 586109-EPP-1-2017-1-RO-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP Project coordinator: University of Craiova, Romania Project title: Implementation of Education Quality Assurance system via cooperation of University-Business-Government in HEIs (EDUQAS) / 2017-2021

Evaluator extern: Prof. PhD. ALEXANDRU ŢUGUI

Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, A.I. Cuza University Iași, Romania ARACIS Expert <u>http://www.aracis.ro/</u> <u>http://pfe.aracis.ro/inscriere/registru/evaluator/1241/</u>

1. Introduction (brief description of the output as in the application)

Main objective: To improve quality culture in Kazakh and Ukrainian higher education institutions by establishing units, standards and guidelines dealing with internal QA in line with advanced EU practices.

Key actions:

- Training for all the actors involved in the quality cycle (QA officers, deans, professors, administrative staff) that are tailored to the specific needs in PC;
- Creation of peer networks for all the actors' groups and a pool of experts trained and actively involved in the process of internal QA of certain (selected) study programs;
- ► Internal evaluation of 2 pilot education programs Bsc and Msc at each HEI partner from PC;
- ► Link between quality assurance structures of HE institutions in PgC and PC.

Planned activities:

Work Package and category	Title	Activities	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)
WP1 Preparation	The overview of EU&PC QA policy strategy on national and institutional levels	1.1. Analyze QA systems in EU and PC1.2. Train PC QA specialists1.3. Launch project web-site	Overview of EU&PC proposals of standards; QA specialists' training; project web site.
WP2 Development	QA strategy & policy development	2.1. Develop QA strategy and policy2.2. Design program development2.3. Train academic staff2.4. Improve regulations of students study "life-cycle"	QA strategy, policy&procedures staff training; program development; regulations of students "life cycle".
WP3 Capacity building	Implementation of internal QA systems	 3.1. Purchase new equipment 3.2. Identify and upgrade tools for QA and data collection 3.3. Launch QA units in PC 3.4. Develop expert partnership network 3.5. Pilot internal assessment of programs 	QA units launch; new equipment purchase; expert network development; pilot progress assessment.
WP4 Quality plan	Quality Assurance	4.1. Develop evaluation program4.2. Internal & external evaluation	Evaluation plan; quality internal and external reports.
WP5 Dissemination & exploitation	Dissemination and exploitation strategy	5.1. Create strategy & plan for project dissemination and sustainability5.2. Develop web-site5.3. Organize dissemination events	Dissemination and sustainability plan; project website; dissemination events; web-site development
WP6 Management	Project Management	6.1. Coordination and operational management6.2. Financial management and control6.3. Manage QA unit	Project management procedures and reports; financial reports; QA unit management.

2. Description of the processes (achieved actions and results/deliverables related to the work plan)

WP1/Preparation - The overview of EU&PC QA policy strategy on national and institutional levels

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
1.1. Analyze QA systems in EU and PC	Analysis on existing QA systems in Ukraine and Kazakhstan. A survey form was agreed in September 2018 at the management meeting in Stockholm as support internal document for this activity; it was fulfilled by the PC partners and provided to the national coordinators to build reports on the QA systems in PC. Analysis of QA policy and Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area. Review on how EU HEIs implement the QA policy requirements on European, national, and institutional levels. Identify main challenges of the European quality assurance policy implementation in the examined EU&PC HEIs	Overview of EU&PC standard proposalse	Report on QA systems in PC - Ukraine and Kazakhstan Report on QA systems at EU partners The analysis on existing QA systems in Ukraine and Kazakhstan, as well in EU countries was deeply accomplished. The activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The deliverables are in accordance with the expected outputs.	Achieved
1.2. Train PC QA specialists	Project kick-off meeting and 5 trainings for PC QA specialists achieved by EU experts (P1-P6).	QA specialists' training	Minutes of Training meetings: <u>Craiova, Feb. 2018</u> <u>Plovdiv, May 2018</u> <u>Stockholm, Sep. 2018</u> <u>Liege, Jan. 2019</u> <u>Nancy, Mar. 2019</u> <u>Riga, May 2019</u> Teaching materials, Attendance lists, available on the project website: <u>http://web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas/protected/</u> Password: edupass17 The training meetings were carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The teaching materials are available on the project website meetings together with the agendas and meetings' minutes.	Achieved

	Website design; Website initial content; Website	Project web site	http://web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas/	Achieved
	implementation; Website beta-release; Website		Report on project website	
	launching.			
	It contains a password protected area containing		The website has been launched in time. It is well	
	working documents; the access is restricted to the		structured and permanently updated according to	
	project partners and monitoring authorities only;		the project development. Il also facilitates the	
	password: edupass17. Once a document was		change of documents between partners.	
1.3. Launch project	completed, it was available in the public section of			
web-site	the website.			
	It also contains a tool for partner interaction			
	(transferring documents); each partner has his own			
	credentials to access this tool.			
	A beta-version of the project website was available			
	starting from December 2017. The official launch			
	was done during the project kick-off meeting,			
	Craiova, Feb. 2018			

WP2/Development - QA strategy & policy development

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
2.1. Develop QA strategy and policy	Identifying the QA needs in PC: structures to be subject to assessment (study programme, field of study, department, faculty, institution), quality culture development, policies, standards, procedures and tools of quality assessment. Proposal by PC partners of QA policies according with the national legislation in higher education, and based on the EU policies and examples of good practices acquired during the teaching meetings.	QA strategy, policy&procedures	QA policy and strategy in EU, UA, KZ - case studyRecommendations for establish an internal QA systemThe activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The QA policy and strategy in EU, UA, KZ was synthesized and Recommendations for internal QA system in PC were created.	Achieved
2.2. Design program development	Each HEI from PC proposed 2 study programms (1 licence degree and 1 master degree) to be improved within the project	Program development	Report on programme design, review and pilotassessmentSelf-evaluation reports of L and M programsfrom HEI PC partners:	Achieved

	They prepared self-evaluation reports as a preliminary stage of external evaluation.		Self-evaluation report L – P7Self-evaluation report M – P7Self-evaluation report L – P8Self-evaluation report L – P9Self-evaluation report L – P9Self-evaluation report L – P10Self-evaluation report M – P10Self-evaluation report L – P10Self-evaluation report L – P10Self-evaluation report L – P10Self-evaluation report L – P10Self-evaluation report L&M – P11Self-evaluation report L&M – P12The activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. Every partner HEI from PC proposed 2 improved study programs for which	
			self-evaluation reports were delivered.	
2.3. Train academic staff	The academic staff trained during the training meetings were evaluated by means of a dedicated questionnaire and two reports with the evaluation results were provided.	Staff training	Reports on training results evaluationReport - Feb 2021Report - May 2021The activity was carried out as assumed in theproject proposal. The delivered reports confirmthe competences of the trained experts.	Achieved
2.4. Improve regulations of students study "life- cycle"	The training sessions contained examples of good practices in EU on student life-cycle monitoring. Improved regulations were provided for students' life cycle assessment in UA in KZ as valuable tools to evaluate the quality of teaching and learning up to "the knowledge triangle": research, education and innovation.	Regulations of students "life cycle".	Regulation on student's "life cycle" in UARegulation on student's "life cycle" in KZImproved regulations were provided for students' life cycle assessment in UA in KZ. The reports delivered are relevant.	Achieved

WP3/Capacity building - Implementation of internal QA systems

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
3.1. Purchase new equipment	Performing administrative steps to purchase necessary equipment according to the national legislation and project detailed description. Related	New equipment purchase	Financial documents	Achieved

	documents were provided by the HEIs partners from PC		The equipment was purchased as assumed in the project proposal. Proofing documents were provided.	
3.2. Identify and upgrade tools for QA and data collection	Analyse existing QA tools at HEIs from PC. Identify relevant tools and improve them to be useful for the new established QA units.	Recommendations to be considered by the launched QA units	Recommendations for establish an internal QAsystemThe activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The recommendations for establish QA systems in HEIs from PC were provided as project deliverable.	Achieved
3.3. Launch QA units in PC	6 QA units were launched at all partner HEIs from PC: P7-P12. They were also evaluated by external expert teams.	QA units launch	Provided as project deriverable.Quality Assurance Units launched in PC HEIs:Report on Quality Assurance Units launched in PCHEIsP7 - Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University ofEconomicsP8 - Lviv Polytechnic National UniversityP9 - Donetsk State University of ManagementP10 - National Metallurgical Academy of UkraineP11 - Ablai Khan University of InternationalRelations and World LanguagesP12 - Kazakh University of Economy, Finance andInternational TradeExpert Reports on QA Units in PC HEIs:Expert report on QA unit P7Expert report on QA unit P8Expert report on QA unit P10Expert report on QA unit P11Expert report on QA unit P12The QA units were launched or improved at the sixHEIs from PC. The delivered report is relevant. The QA units are assessed by external experts after the evaluation visits.	Achieved
3.4. Develop expert partnership network	QA expert network was created by involving EU&PC universities, national QA agencies, associated partners, business and local/national authorities in order to ensure successful operation of QA systems.	Expert network development	Report on the creation of an expert networkAn expert network was created and it is continuously extended. A related report was built.	Achieved

3.5. Pilot internal		Pilot progress	Expert Reports on L and M programs from HEI	Achieved
assessment of		assessment.	PC partners:	
programs			Expert report $L - P7$	
			Expert report M – P7	
			Expert report $L - P8$	
			Expert report M – P8	
			Expert report $L - P9$	
	2 means (DSa and MSa) were mileted at each of		Expert report M – P9	
	2 programs (BSc and MSc) were piloted at each of 6 HEIs from PC by external expert teams.		Expert report $L - P10$	
	o heis nom re by external expert teams.		Expert report M – P10	
			Expert report L&M – P11	
			Expert report $L - P12$	
			Expert report M – P12	
			6 BSc and 6 MSc programs were evaluated by	
			external expert teams and experts' reports were	
			provided.	

WP4/Quality plan - Quality Assurance

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
4.1. Develop evaluation program	Development of the quality plan of the project based on the detailed description of activities, with the contribution of all partners. The final form was agreed by the steering committee and all participants during the management meeting in	Evaluation plan	Project quality plan The project quality plan was developed. It is available on the project website.	Achieved
4.2. Internal & external evaluation	Stockholm, September 2018 Permanent internal monitoring of the progress of the QA system implementation, assess the fulfilment of the procedures, the development of actions directed to correct and prevent mistakes, examine the depth-in analyses of QA system failures. To the end of the project, the coordinator organized an external audit for factual findings on the project.	Quality internal and external reports	Quality internal reports:Impact of the project in KZInternal evaluation of the trained experts:Report 1 - Feb 2021Report 2 - May 2021Internal evaluation of the project meetings:- Questionnaire	Achieved

	- Participant satisfaction regarding project events	
	The activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The deliverables are in accordance with the expected outputs.	

WP5/Dissemination & exploitation - Dissemination and exploitation strategy

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
5.1. Create strategy & plan for project dissemination and sustainability	Development of the strategy of dissemination and stability of project results. The final form was agreed by the steering committee and all participants during the management meeting in Stockholm, in September 2018	Dissemination and sustainability plan	Project Dissemination and Sustainability Strategy Meeting minutes Stockholm The Project Dissemination and Sustainability Strategy has been created and approved at the training and management meeting in Stockholm.	Achieved
5.2. Develop web- site	The project website is the key source for information, dissemination and management of the project. It is stored on a server of the project coordinator, and does not use public platforms. The management tools are located in the protected area, where each partner has his own private space for document transfer with the national-, regional- and project coordinator. The security and maintenance of the website is of high importance. The maintenance is performed continuously by the IT specialists of the coordinator. It is populated permanently with dissemination and internal documents. The partners sent their suggestions regarding the content of the website at the official project email address. A Facebook page was also launched and it is maintained by P9 (Donetsk State University of Management, Ukraine).	Web-site development	Project website: <u>http://web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas/</u> Project facebook site: <u>https://www.facebook.com/eduqasdsum/</u> The activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The deliverables are in accordance with the expected outputs.	Achieved

	ation actions are in compliance	Dissemination events	The project website includes a section on	Achieved
	egy of dissemination and stability of		dissemination <u>here</u>	
- Each partner	of the consortium ensures the		Dissemination report in UA	
visibility of the	project, according to the publicity		Annex 1	
obligations. Th	ere are hyperlinks on the project		Annex 2	
website to the s	sections dedicated to the project on			
partners' offici	al websites.		Dissemination report in KZ	
- The project m	nain events are promoted in local		Annex 1	
media (written	press and video), and the related		Annex 2	
web links are a	vailable on the project and			
partners' webs	ites in English and in the local			
official language	ges of PCs.		Bilingual project booklet	
- The dissemin	ation events are reported in the			
dissemination	reports available on the project		- The First Large Scale International Conference	
website: Meeti	ng with LPNU Vice Rector on		on Higher Education Quality Assurance in	
International re	elations and LPNU administration;		Ukraine / June 11-12, 2019, Kyiv, Ukraine	
Meeting with a	cademics and non-academic staff at		- <u>Conference program</u>	
	ation of project for DSUM			
	ncil (# 1 in Dissemination plan);		- International Scientific and Practical	
Launching and	updating of the website (# 2 in		Conference "Promoting Effective Quality	
Dissemination	plan); Information on the DSUM		Culture Practices in Higher Education in	
website (# 3 in	Dissemination plan); Profile in		Kazakhstan: Benchmarking and Resource	
Facebook (# 4	in Dissemination plan); Issue of		Search" / November 12-15, 2019, Almaty,	
leaflet and roll-	-up (# 5 in Dissemination plan) /		Kazakhstan	
printed materia	ls; Internal seminar (# 6 in		- Conference program	
Dissemination	plan) at DSUM; Promotion of the			
project at the n	ational/international conferences (#		List of publications	
10 in Dissemin	ation plan) by DSUM; Designing			
and suggestion	of project logo to project		The project benefited by many disseimnation	
management by	y P11; Translation of project		actions. Dissemination reports were provided by	
information to	local languages (Information on		the partners from PC.	
Kazakh and Ru	ssian Languages); Creation of			
webpage on of	ficial HEI website by the partners			
from Kazakhst	an; Establishment of project			
booklet – bilin	gual; Cluster meeting in			
Kazakhstan.	-			
- Photos from a	dissemination events are also			
available on the	e project website.			
- Two large co	nferences were organized for the			
	of results in UA and KZ.			

-	Papers were published to disseminate project
r	esults.
-	The project benefitted from extensive
d	issemination actions organized by associated
p	artners (e.g. IAAR and AUF), shown on the
p	roject webpage.

WP6/Management - Project Management

Planned activities	Description of achievement	Expected Outputs (tangible) and Outcomes (intangible)	Achieved Deliverables and Remarks	Degree of achievement
6.1. Coordination	- Online management meeting with all partners	Project management	- Minutes of the online meeting, January 2018	Achieved
and operational	succeeded in January 2018	procedures and reports	- Minutes of the project meeting in Craiova.	
management	- Attendance to the training at the CBHE projects		February 2018	
	kick-off meeting in Brussels, January 2018;		- Training materials from CBHE Grantholders'	
	- Project kick-off meeting in Craiova, February		Meeting Brussels, January 2018, shared with	
	2018; an online webex meeting with the project		the partners on the project website	
	officer from EACEA was achieved during this			
	meeting.		- Project handbook	
	- Steering committee of the project established at		- Management procedure	
	the project kick-off meeting.		- <u>Communication procedure within the project</u>	
	- Partnership agreements signed by the project		- Tool for partner interaction with individual	
	coordinator (University of Craiova) in due time		accounts for authorized users	
	with 15 of the 16 partners. Partner P14 (NAQA			
	Ukraine) joined the project late, for reasons related		- Management documents, including the grant	
	to its legal status.		agreement, shared with the partners on the	
	- Issue of the project handbook.		project website	
	- Management meeting organized together with		This section is available for the project partners	
	each training meeting in Plovdiv, Stockholm,		only, it is password protected: "edupass17"	
	Liège, Nancy, Riga and with evaluation meetings			
	at partners from in PC.		- <u>Minutes of the project meeting in Plovdiv</u> ,	
	- Issue of the Communication procedure within the		<u>May 2018</u>	
	project.		- <u>Minutes of the project meeting in Stockholm</u> ,	
	- Continuous communication through the official		<u>Sep. 2018</u>	
l	email account of the project:		- Minutes of the project meeting in Liège,	
	eduqas.ucv@outlook.com		January 2019	

	- Management of the internal documents transferred between partners and national/regional/project coordinator thanks to the dedicated tool containing individual accounts for authorized users.		 <u>Minutes of the project meeting in Nancy.</u> <u>March 2019</u> <u>Minutes of the project meeting in Riga, Mary 2019</u> <u>Minutes of the online management meeting.</u> <u>Oct. 2018</u> <u>Minutes of the management and evaluation meeting in Almaty, Nov. 2019</u> <u>Minutes of the management and evaluation meeting in Lviv, Dec. 2019</u> <u>Minutes of the online management meeting.</u> <u>Jan. 2020</u> <u>Minutes of the online management meeting.</u> <u>Apr. 2020</u> <u>Minutes of the online management meeting.</u> <u>Jan. 2021</u> <u>Minutes of the online management meeting.</u> <u>Mar. 2021</u> The management activities were carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The proofing deliverables are relevant. 	
6.2. Financial management and control	 Partnership agreements finalised in due time with 15 of 16 partners Financial management details were discussed to all management meetings detailed above; the financial officer of the project responded to all partners' request (concerning financial and equipment purchase aspects) and found proper solutions according to the specific legislation Planning of the financial resources at the level of the coordinator and partners Planning the financial-accounting procedures of the project, the documentation of the financial reports, the interim and second pre-financing requests Several transfers of the instalment to the Ukrainian partners who specifically asked for such a solution to ensure their efficient funds management in accordance with the national legislation; the related bank transfer costs were 	Financial reports	 Statements on the use of the instalment Individual travel reports; time-sheets; joint of declarations of team members; invoices transferred to the coordinator via the online tool for partner interaction The financial management was rigorously accomplished. 	Achieved

	 supported by the coordinator from the co-financing quote, without impeding the planned project progress Constant and continuous communication, monitoring and control to solve any partners' request Speeding-up the equipment purchase in compliance with the EU and PC legal constraints 			
6.3. Manage QA unit	QA unit management are performed by the Head appointed at each unit by university administration from the project team or staff trained within the project. The Head of QA unit is responsible for operations, internal evaluation of pilot programs, dissemination concerning the QA activity, communication with the steering committee, Erasmus+ national agency, project coordinator about all the barriers and inconveniences that may occur, QA units will be integrated in the organizational structure of PC HEIs during or after the end of the project	QA unit management	Report on Quality Assurance Units launched in PC HEIS The activity was carried out as assumed in the project proposal. The deliverables are in accordance with the expected outputs.	Achieved

Conclusions and recommendation:

- 1. All activities have been implemented in accordance with the project proposal;
- 2. The results of the project are relevant and have been obtained in the context of quality assurance policies in European practice;
- 3. Although the project activity schedule supported some gaps, the project partners achieved the proposed impact results;

4. It is recommended to continue the collaboration between the European partners and the PC in order to harmonize the practices regarding the quality of education and their alignment with the best practices.

Prof. PhD. ALEXANDRU ŢUGUI