ANALYSIS

of partner countries quality assurance systems in the context of wp1

"THE OVERVIEW OF EU&PC QA POLICY STRATEGY ON NATIONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL LEVELS"

Donetsk state university
of management
Mariupol, Ukraine

web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas

facebook.com/EDUQASErasmus

About the project ERASMUS+ EDUQAS "Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System via Cooperation of University- Business-Government in HEIs"

The wider objective of the project is to improve education quality assurance systems through development of efficient internal quality standards leading to better employability of students in Partner Countries Universities. The internal QA system is based on analysis of needs and capacities in Kazakh and Ukrainian HEIs, experiences and best practices from the successful quality assurance action line of the Bologna Process.

Main goals:

•	to promote the creation of quality culture at various levels through motivation, trust, responsibility of students, institutional leadership, individual staff members;
•	to elaborate proposals for the design of programmes on Bachelor and Master levels with the involvement of all stakeholders;
•	to develop technologies of assessment quality of Bachelor and Master programmes; designed programmes should meet the objectives including learning outcomes;
•	to conduct training for the QA specialist and academic staff;
•	to improve affiliate network university-business-government, collaboration with the EU universities;
•	to enhance internal university information systems of quality evaluation;
•	to develop a corporate QA infrastructure based on ICT, on-line, mobile technologies.

Partnership:

- P1 - UNIVERSITATEA DIN CRAIOVA, Craiova, Romania – Project coordinator
- P2 - KUNGLIGA TEKNISKA HOEGSKOLAN, Stockolm, Sweden
- P3 - UNIVERSITE DE LIEGE, Liege, Belgium
- P4 - UNIVERSITY OF PLOVDIV PAISII HILENDARSKI, Plovdiv, Bulgaria
- P5 - LATVIJAS UNIVERSITATE, Riga, Latvia
- P6 - UNIVERSITE DE LORRAINE, Nancy Cedex, France
- P7 - SIMON KUZNETS KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS, Kharkiv, Ukraine
- P8 - LVIV POLYTECHNIC NATIONAL UNIVERSITY, Lviv, Ukraine
- P9 - DONETSK STATE UNIVERSITY OF MANAGEMENT, Mariupil, Ukraine
- P10 - NATIONAL METALLURGICAL ACADEMY OF UKRAINE, Dnipropetrovsk, Ukraine
- P11 - ABLAI KHAN UNIVERSITY OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND WORLD LANGUAGES, Almaty, Kazakhstan
- P12 - KAZAKH UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMY, FINANCE AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE, Astana, Kazakhstan
- P13 - INSTITUTE OF HIGHER EDUCATION, NATIONAL ACADEMY OF EDUCATION, Kyiv, Ukraine
- P14 - NATIONAL AGENCY FOR HIGHER EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE, Kyiv, Ukraine
- P15 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF UKRAINE, Kyiv, Ukraine
- P16 - MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE, Astana, Kazakhstan
- P17 - HAUT CONSEIL DE L'EVALUATION DE LA RECHERCHE ET DE L'ENSEIGNEMENT, Paris, France

contents

PART I
Ukrainian Case Study: National Higher Education, Research and QA context (with focus on Doctorate level)

Overall landscape – National Higher Education (HE), research and QA context

1.1. Brief presentation of the HE and research system

Ukraine is a state in Eastern Europe and partly in Central Europe located in the south-western part of the East European Plain. Its area is 603, 628 sq. km.

Ukraine ranks eighth in Europe in terms of population. According to the latest census of population, over 48.4 million people live in Ukraine, including 77.8% of Ukrainians and 17.3% of Russians. A share of the urban population is 67.2%. The official language in Ukraine is Ukrainian.

According to the Constitution, all citizens are provided with an access to free education. Complete general secondary education is compulsory in public schools, which constitute the overwhelming majority. Free higher education in public and municipal educational institutions is implemented on a competitive basis.

There are 288 higher educational institutions of higher accreditation levels in Ukraine. They include 196 institutions of state ownership, 80 institutions of private ownership and 12 institutions of municipal ownership.

A mission of higher educational institutions (academic institutions) of Ukraine is as follows: to create, systematize, store and disseminate modern scientific knowledge in order to improve the quality of life of people; to train specialists of European and world level in terms of intellectual and personal development. Higher education institutions of Ukraine realize their mission through main areas for development, which include social & pedagogic, international educative & training, scientific & research, innovative productive & business activities and others. These areas are put into practice through particular steps of development.

1.2. National regulations concerning Ukrainian HE studies

The main document that initiated the reform of quality assurance systems in Ukraine should be considered the Decree of the President of Ukraine on June 25, 2013 № 344/2013 "On Approval of the National Strategy for the Development of Education in Ukraine until 2021", which for the first time formulated the task of developing a system of indicators of quality education at the national level, reflecting the conditions, processes and educational outcomes. The greatest contribution to the legislative regulation of quality assurance systems has the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" dated July 1, 2014.

The best of today is the detailed description of the provisions of the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" (hereinafter referred to as the Law) contained in (unfortunately not adopted) the Draft Strategy for the Reform of Higher Education in Ukraine until 2020, in which a separate section 3.2 "Creation of a Quality Assurance System for Higher Education" is dedicated. By this document the essence of higher education reform is directly called the establishment of a system for the provision and continuous improvement of the quality of higher education that meets EHEA recommendations and standards, takes into account best international practices and serves as the main technology for achieving the answer the educational system requirements and needs of society and personality. The key tasks of such reform are:

a) institutionalization of the system of providing higher education quality at the national, regional and local levels with the participation of state, public and professional players;

b) involvement of external and internal stakeholders in the development of new "rules of the game" (a set of legal acts and methodological developments) that can guarantee the stable functioning and development of the system of quality assurance in higher education;

c) the formation of an environment in which the improvement of the quality of higher education will become a central theme of public discourse, where the formation of a new professional ethos will become a unifying front for participants, and new media platforms will provide the necessary publicity and transparency.

Among the first steps were called:

— development of **standards of higher education** [1] with the active participation of stakeholders;

— the development of a methodological basis and the provision of practical assistance to higher education institutions in establishing an internal quality assurance system, including through the establishment and maintenance the **standards of educational activity** [2].

The first task is now gradually solved with the participation of the Scientific-Methodical Council of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine and its commissions and subcommittees on specialties. Today, more than 30 percent of the standards for the bachelor's degree have already been publicly discussed, and standards are being developed intensively for the educational level of the master's degree and the educational-scientific level of the doctor of philosophy. Instead, the formation of modern quality assurance systems for higher education has not yet made visible progress - the work of the National Agency for the Quality Assurance of Higher Education has already been delayed, and higher education institutions have not yet received any methodological assistance in the formation of the internal system quality assurance in higher education. In this review, we will try to provide an analysis of the relevance / inconsistency of the current practice of ensuring higher education quality in Ukraine to the requirements of the Standards and Recommendations on Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area from May 2015 (hereinafter ESG 2015).

— On August 20, 2018 110 draft standards have been developed for the educational level of the Bachelor; 90 draft standards - for the educational level of the Master.

— On August 20, 2018 190 draft standards for educational levels Bachelor and Master have passed public discussion.

— 71 draft standards for educational levels for Bachelor and Master have passed all stages of approval.

---

1. set of requirements for the content and results of educational activities of HEIs and scientific institutions at each level of higher education within each specialty (Law "On Higher Education", Article 10)

2. set of minimum requirements for personnel, educational, methodological, logistics and informational ensurance of educational process of a HEI and a scientific institution (Law "On Higher Education", Article 9)

— On October, 4, 2018 by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science were approved 10 new standards of Bachelor's level of higher education for specialties: "Ecology", "Physics and Astronomy", "Cyber Security", "Shipbuilding", "Metallurgy", "Automation and Computer-Integrated Technologies" "Biotechnology and bioengineering", "Agronomy", "Tourism" and "Railway transport", as well as 1 standard master's degree for the specialty "Ecology".

1.3. HEI Governing Bodies

The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine is the main body in the system of central executive bodies that ensures the formation and implementation of the state policy in the spheres of education and science; academic, scientific, technical and innovative activities; transfer of technologies as well as ensures the formation and implementation of the state policy in the sphere of state control over the activity of educational institutions, enterprises, agencies and organizations that provide services in the field of education or carry out other activities related to the provision of such services regardless of their subordination and form of ownership.

The National Agency for Higher Education Quality Assurance (NAHEQA) is one of the governing bodies in the sphere of higher education, the creation of which is provided for in the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education.

The National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance (NAHEQA) is a permanent collegiate body authorized by the legislation of Ukraine to implement state policy in the field of higher education quality assurance.

The Agency has assumed certain regulatory and control functions of the MES; replaced the Higher Attestation Commission (HAC) and the State Accreditation Commission (SAC).

Functions of the National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance (NAHEQA):

1.   forms requirements for the system of quality assurance in higher education, develops the provision for accreditation of educational programs and submits it for approval by the Ministry of

Education and Science

2.   analyzes the quality of educational activities of higher education institutions;

3.   conducts licensing expertise, prepares an expert opinion on the possibility of issuing a license for the conducting of educational activity;

4.   formulates proposals on the list of specialties to conduct the training of higher education applicants at the relevant levels of higher education;

5.   forms a single database of higher education institutions of specialization at each level of higher education;

6.   carries out accreditation of educational programs;

7.   establishes criteria for assessing the quality of educational activities, including scientific achievements, higher education institutions of Ukraine, which can determine the ratings of higher education institutions of Ukraine;

8.   develops the requirements for the level of scientific qualification of persons who acquire scientific degrees, develops the procedure for their award by specialized academic councils of HEIs (scientific institutions) and submits it for approval by the Ministry of Education and Science;

9.   develops a regulation on the accreditation of specialized academic councils and submits it for approval by the Ministry of Education and Science, accredited specialized scientific councils and controls their activities;

10.   accredites independent evaluation institutions and quality assurance of higher education.

On April 15, 2015, the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine adopted a decision to establish the National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance.

In June 2015, the first members were elected to the Agency, and on July 27, 2016, the Cabinet of Ministers approved a new version of the Charter, the personal composition of the NAHEQA, determined the limit number of staff.

The process of creating and launching the NAHEQA was widely disseminated in the media.

The results of the election of the members of the Agency, which took place in June 2015, outraged the public, Ministry issued a statement with condemned reaction on the results of election.

The Law of Ukraine "On Education" (September 5, 2017) changed the principles of the formation of the NAHEQA (on a competitive basis) and determined the reload of NAHEQA.

By the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine on November 22, 2017, No. 926, was adopted the Regulation on the competitive commission for the selection of members of NAHEQA, and also stipulated that it will consist of nine persons, including representatives of European organizations:

• Representative of the Ministry of Education and Science

• Representative from the European Association for the Quality Assurance of Higher Education (ENQA)

• Representative from the Association of European Universities (EUA)

• Representative from the European Association of Higher Education Institutions (EURASHE)

• Representative from the European Union of Students (ESU)

• Representative of the joint representative body of all-Ukrainian associations of employers' organizations

• Representative of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine

• Representative of the National Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine

• Representative of the NGO "Ukrainian Student Association", a member of the European Union of Students (ESU).

On January 31, 2018, the Government approved the personal composition of the commission.

In September 2018, the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine approved the Regulation on the selection of members of the National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance.

The Regulation determines the stages of the competition, the list of documents required for participation in the competition, qualification requirements for candidates for membership of the National Agency, criteria for assessing candidates.

Candidates to the National Agency will be evaluated according to the following criteria:

•professional achievements;

•adherence in the professional activity the academic integrity;

•the practice of applying standards and recommendations on quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area and the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" in the professional activity;

•experience of work with international and national organizations working in the field of education and educational projects;

•experience of work or study at a foreign HEI and / or a scientific institution;

•English proficiency.

From 1 to 31 October 2018 it is continued the process of receiving the documents from persons who wish to become members of the National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance.

The National Agency of Higher Education Quality Assurance should include 23 members: two persons from the applicants of higher education at first and second level, three representatives from all-Ukrainian associations of employers' organizations, at least one representative of the employees of the National Academy of Sciences, HEIs of state, communal and private ownership, one representative from the national branch academies of sciences.

The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine expects that the National Agency will start its work at the beginning of 2019.

Special academic boards are the main link in the system of certification of academic personnel of the highest qualification, which operate at scientific & research and scientific & technical institutions, higher educational institutions and other organizations and conduct fundamental and applied scientific research and have sufficient level of staffing, financial and logistical support for the

training of highly qualified academic personnel.

As of the beginning of 2017, there are 994 special academic boards (727 doctoral boards and 267 candidate boards) involving 572 academic specialties in Ukraine. 763 special academic boards operate at higher education institutions and, accordingly, 231 operate at research institutions.

1.4. Description of the general architecture of training programs provision and of Degrees awarded

Training of higher education Ph.D. candidates is carried out as follows:

— Postgraduate education program at a higher education institution (an academic institution) involving intramural (day, evening) and extramural forms of study

— Outside the postgraduate education program (for individuals who professionally conduct academic, scientific & technical and scientific & pedagogical activities at the main place of work in the respective higher educational institution (academic institution)

— Self-guided preparation of academic achievements to be presented.

Postgraduate and doctoral educational programs are implemented as follows:

— At the expense of the state budget (government contract)

— At the expense of legal or natural persons (under the terms of a contract, in particular, by means of grants received by a higher educational institution (academic institution) to conduct scientific researches, which provide for the training of higher education Doctor of Philosophy or Doctor of Science candidates).

The Ph.D. training curriculum should contain information on the list and scope of the academic disciplines (30-60 ECTS credits), the sequence of their study, the forms of training sessions and their scope, the schedule of the educational process, the forms of current and final control.

1.5. Articulation between Master and Doctorate level, statistics per level of study and field of study, students /graduates statistics

The Master's degree is an educational degree obtained at the second level of higher education and awarded by a higher educational institution as a result of successful completion of a corresponding educational program by the higher education candidate. Master's degree is obtained on the basis of educational & professional or educational & scientific program. The volume of the educational & professional master's program is 90-120 ECTS credits, and the volume of the educational & scientific program is 120 ECTS credits. The educational & scientific master's program must include a research (scientific) component amounting to at least 30 percent of the whole volume.

The Doctor of Philosophy is an educational degree and, at the same time, the first academic degree obtained at the third level of higher education on the basis of a master's degree. The degree of the Doctor of Philosophy is awarded by a special academic board functioning at the higher educational institution or academic institution as a result of successful completion of the relevant educational & academic program by a higher education candidate and the public defence of the thesis work (doctoral dissertation) against a special academic board.

The graduation of master's and postgraduate students from higher educational institutions of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine for the period of 2012 to 2016

Year	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Master's students	61,689	67,260	58,006	59,319	37,725
Postgraduate students	4,937	4,819	4,584	4,908	4,289

References to the national qualifications frameworks

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine on Higher Education the National Qualifications Framework is interpreted as a description of qualification levels that are systemized and structured on the basis of competences.

The third (scientific and research) cycle of higher education corresponds to the ninth level of the National qualification framework.

Scientific and research cycle of higher education allows students to acquire theoretical knowledge, skills, experience and other competences that are sufficient for development of new ideas, solution of complex problems in profession, research and innovation, to acquire scientific and pedagogic methodology, and also to conduct independent academic research which results include scientific novelty, academic value and practical impact.

The number of persons entered the postgraduate education program in 2016 by fields of study (at the costs of state budget)

TOTAL, persons	3,000
Education	**305**
Culture and Art	**49**
Humanities Courses	**299**
Theology	**0**
Social and Behavioural Sciences	**445**

Journalism	**29**
Management and Administration	**153**
Law	**170**
Biology	**81**
Natural Sciences	**182**
Mathematics and Statistics	**99**
Information Technology	**150**
Mechanical Engineering	**125**
Electrical Engineering	**71**
Automation and Instrument Making	**99**
Chemical and Bioengineering	**66**
Electronics and Telecommunications	**65**
Production and Technology	**117**

Architecture and Construction	**117**
Agrarian Sciences and Foodstuffs	**155**
Veterinary Medicine	**68**
Health Care	**50**
Social Work	**9**
Service Sector	**0**
Military Sciences, National Security, State Border Security	**9**
Civil Security	**10**
Transport	**77**

National statistics on research and role of the HEIs within the research system (if some), research priorities (at national level or at HEI level)? Role of other actors (if some)

The scientific researches in Ukraine are carried out in accordance with the following principles:

— Priority areas for development of science and technology for the period until 2020 (Law of Ukraine on Priority Directions for Development of Science and Technology № 2623-III dated 11.07.2001 (as amended on 16.01.2016)

— Priority thematic areas of scientific research and scientific & technological developments for the period until 2020 (resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 942 dated 07.09.2011)

— Medium-term priority directions of innovative activity at the national level for the period 2017-2021 (resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 1056 dated 28.12.2016).

Doctors of philosophy are involved in work related to scientific & research topics of higher educational institutions (academic institutions); the research results are further used in their thesis research.

EMPLOYMENT
Full-time graduates in 2012-2016
studied under the government contract

Year	Graduates				
	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Number of graduates – total	**3 462**	**3 400**	**3 275**	**3 474**	**2 967**
Employment in their own universities and higher educational establishments of the system of the Ministry of Education and Science	**2 449**	**2 446**	**2 433**	**2 656**	**2 049**
Employment in other institutions and enterprises	**879**	**826**	**776**	**678**	**713**
No data on employment	**134**	**128**	**66**	**140**	**205**

1.6. Brief presentation of the doctorate level
How is doctorate level organized in the country?

The new Regulation on study of doctors of philosophy and doctors of science which determines the procedures of study at the third educational and scientific cycle of higher education in higher education institutions and research institutes in Ukraine (the Regulation), was approved by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No.261 dated 23.03.2016.

The study of postgraduate students in higher education institutions (research institutes) that commenced before the Regulation on study of philosophy and doctors of science will

continue in accordance with the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 300 dated 01 March 1999.

Accordingly, postgraduate students who applied for degrees of candidate of science and doctor of science will finish their study under respective programs in 2019.

Number of HEIs providing Cycle 3, Fields of interest at national level, Role of HEI in research and delivery of doctoral programs, award of qualifications

Information about number of HEIs and research institutes (RIs) providing Cycle 3 by fields of study is listed below:

Field of study	Number of HEIs	Number of RIs
Education	142	9
Culture and Art	32	0
Humanities Courses	154	15
Theology	3	0
Social and Behavioural Sciences	226	23
Journalism	14	0
Management and Administration	231	11
Law	60	8
Biology	36	24

Natural Sciences	112	35
Mathematics and Statistics	46	11
Information Technology	118	9
Mechanical Engineering	126	10
Electrical Engineering	46	8
Automation and Instrument Making	49	3
Chemical and Bioengineering	29	1
Electronics and Telecommunications	30	2
Production and Technology	46	2
Architecture and Construction	35	1
Agrarian Sciences and Foodstuffs	48	31
Veterinary Medicine	17	4
Health Care	83	29
Social Work	18	1
Service Sector	7	0

Military Sciences, National Security, State Border Security	16	3
Civil Security	11	1
Transport	31	0
Public management and administration	39	2
International relations	28	2

National statistics on Doctorate studies

Statistics on doctorate students in Ukraine:

Year	PhD students in full-time study	Including PhD students at the cost of state budget (government contract)
2010	19 560	18 488
2011	19 522	18 399
2012	19 444	18 272
2013	18 366	17 287
2014	16 263	15 032
2015	17 350	13 799
2016	15 757	12 513
2017	15 486	12 263

PART II
Kazakh Case Study: National Higher Education, Research and QA context (with focus on Doctorate level)

Overall landscape – National Higher Education (HE), research and QA context

2.1. Brief presentation of the HE and research system

Quality assurance in Kazakhstan

— Growing autonomy of Universities, transparency and accountability.

— Quality Assurance policy at the each HEI, which is open and forms part of their strategic management.

— Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes.

— The aim of the internal quality system of education is to achieve high quality of students training which corresponds to the requirements of state educational standards and the needs of individuals or legal entities.

— The internal system for assessing the quality of education is a holistic system of diagnostic and evaluation procedures, as well as a set of organizational structures and normative legal materials that ensure the management of the quality of education.

— The purpose of the external quality assurance evaluation is to acquire an official confirmation of the quality of the services provided to a certain standard, for example, the international standard of accreditation agency.

— A certain role in ensuring the internal quality plays a certified quality management system of education (QMS)

2.2. National Qualifications Framework

— Approved in 2012

— Comparable with the European Qualifications Framework

— Updated in 2016

— established within the framework of the National Qualifications Framework and developed with the participation of representatives of education, ministries and employers' associations Preparations for self-certification: correlation of the National framework with the European one, to systematize the existing qualifications and recognize qualifications of Kazakhstan specialists abroad.

— studying international experience

— audit and analysis of documents on the national system of qualifications

— Determination of further steps for the self-certification of the National Qualifications Framework

Activities at the state level:

— The implementation of reforms (the signing of the Bologna Declaration, etc.)

— Financing of Education ("Bolashak", "The best teacher of the year", grant projects, mobility expenses,

etc.)

— Internationalization, etc.

A legal framework has been created:

— National program of state support of education;

— The concept of state policy in the field of education: the State Standard of Higher Education;

— Law on Licensing:

— Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the ratification of the Convention, on the recognition of qualifications relating to higher education";

— New edition of the State Standard;

— Classificator of specialties of higher education, considering 342 specialties;

— Law on Education (1999) and later amendments and additions to it;

— Concept of the development of higher education in the

Republic of Kazakhstan in 1999;

— Resolution "On approval of the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher education";

— The concept of state universities privatization:

— The Law "On Amendments and Additions to Certain Legislative Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Education";

— The State Program for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020.

2.3. National Quality Management System

Specialized accreditation 2605 accredited specialties of higher and postgraduate Education: UNDERGRADUATE – 1503; MASTER – 926; PhD – 176.

International accreditation 515 accredited programs of higher and postgraduate education: UNDERGRADUATE – 243; MASTER – 206; PhD – 66.

NATIONAL REGISTER 1 (list of accreditation agencies): 4 Kazakhstani agencies (IKAQAE, IAAR, KAZSEE, ARQA) and 3 foreign agencies (ASIIN, FIBAA, MusiQuE).

Academic Policy and QUALITY Framework

— Provision of personnel with the needs of industrial and innovative development of the country

— Ensuring the integration of education, science and production, creating conditions for the commercialization of intellectual property products and production

— Training of highly qualified scientific and scientific-pedagogical staff

— Ensuring integration in the European Higher Education Area

— Participation of universities in various ratings (public information)

— Creation of internal quality assurance system. External quality assurance. Accreditation

— Studentcentered teaching, teaching and evaluation

— Innovative learning technologies.

National system of quality assessment

"The totality of institutional structures, procedures, forms and methods of establishing the compliance of the quality of education with state compulsory educational standards, the needs of the individual, society and the state (Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan" On Education "). Till 2020 year: "Achievement of high quality level of higher education, satisfying the needs of the labor market, the individual and corresponding to the best world practices"

2.4. Quality assessment mechanisms

	External evaluation mechanisms	Internal evaluation mechanisms
Student	Unified national testing, State Attestation Commission	Intermediate certification, professional practice
Educational program	EEEA (external evaluation of educational achievements); State Attestation; Specialized accreditation;	Rating of educational programs in the university; Self-assessment; The quality of teaching
HEI	State certification; Verification of compliance with legislation; Institutional accreditation; University Rating	Self-assessment
Self-assessment	Professional area Assignment of professional qualifications and professional certification	——————

— Licensing and state certification are carried out by state bodies,

— Since 2015, state certification has been replaced by accreditation of universities, and state control is carried out by state bodies in the form of licensing audit (according to the State Program for Education Development of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020

— Accreditation and ranking is carried out by independent agencies.

2.5. Certification v.v. accreditation

Certification process	Accreditation
Evaluates the current situation and retrospective	Assesses the situation with a perspective; Shows the dynamics of development
Compares with normative acts	Assesses strategic management
Implemented by the authorized body	Implemented by accreditation bodies
Attraction of Kazakhstan experts only	Attraction of both Kazakhstani and other independent experts: employers, foreign experts

PART III
Case Studies at institutional level
Chapter 1.
Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics

3.1.1. Overview of the HEI

Type of the HEI. According to ownership, Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (hereinafter – KhNUE) is a state-owned HEI established by the State and funded from the State budget. Thus, it is subordinated to a corresponding governmental body, specifically, the Ministry of Education and Science and has the status of a budgetary institution.

Number of students. The total number of KhNUE students amounts to 7,769 students (the situation as of academic year 2016/2017).

The mission of KhNUE – formation of the creative, fully developed personality, a real professional for scientific and practical work in the field of socio-economic activities in order to increase the level and quality of life and progressive development of the

28

society.

The strategic purpose of KhNUE – improving the quality of specialists training to a level that will provide them the opportunity to take a worthy place in society and work successfully according to their specialty in building a society that is based on the global knowledge economy.

KhNUE is at accreditation level IV that means it has passed the institutional accreditation to provide Bachelor, Master, PhD and postdoctoral (Doctor of Sciences) programs. Research is an integral part of the mission of HEIs of the fourth accreditation level.

In accordance with national legislation and licensing requirements, Ukrainian HEIs of the fourth level of accreditation are granted a status equal to that of the research institutes subordinated to the National Academy of Sciences. KhNUE as a state-owned HEI of the fourth level of accreditation has also the status of a national HEI, according to which KhNUE enjoys wider autonomy in decision-making, in some areas, e.g., in establishment and awarding of academic degrees of Docent and Professor to its teaching and research staff.

KhNUE undertakes a considerable range of research activities focused on certain directions of research in various fields related to the development of Ukraine.

In Ukraine access to higher education is open to every person who finishes a 11-year general secondary (incl. primary and secondary) school and obtains full general secondary education certificate. The adoption of a new Law on Higher Education in 2014 formally introduced the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS), the Diploma Supplement, the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), National Qualification Framework of Ukraine (NQFU).

The List of Fields of Study and Program Subject Areas in Higher Education was approved by a Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine in April 2015. There are 27 Fields of Study and 114 Program Subject Areas (detailed fields) in Higher Education. The List mainly corresponds to the International Standard Classification of Education Fields (2013).

Higher education institutions are autonomous in the creation and content of their respective educational curricula. However,

some elements of the study programs are broadly defined by the Law on Higher Education and the national regulations (e.g. the higher education standards, regulation on academic mobility, the share of elective subjects).

Bachelor degree corresponds to 6th qualification level of National Qualifications Frameworks of Ukraine. Bachelor studies at KhNUE last four years (240 ECTS credits). There are some general rules regarding the curricula prescribed by the Ministry of Education and Sciences and the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education. Thus, the general architecture of Bachelor training programs indicates the list of obligatory courses that ensure development of the compulsory (transferable and specific/subject) competencies / learning outcomes and optional courses (25% of the total number of ECTS credits) in every curriculum.

The distribution of the Bachelor Program Subject Areas is based on competence learning and has two cycles: basic general cycle (1-2 years of Bachelor studies) is made up of obligatory courses, such as, *The Ukrainian Language, Foreign Language(s), Social and Economic History of Ukraine and Philosophy* (34 ECTS credits) and options/electives (courses of psychosocial or technology orientation).

Specialisation cycle (2-4 years of Bachelor studies) lists:

1. core courses targeted precisely towards a specific degree profile (100-119 ECTS credits);

2. majors (electives) that are support courses which complement the core courses (30 ECTS credits);

3. minors (electives) that ensure development of organization and communication competencies (20 ECTS credits).

KhNUE includes internship program into the Bachelor curricula to improve students' qualifications in order to increase their employability: 1 year (1 ECTS credit), 2 year (1 ECTS credit); 3 year (3 ECTS credits); 4 (3 ECTS credits).

Students undertake a research project within the KhNUE, where they are required to plan and execute their own work. The projects include economic collaboration. Upon completion of the Bachelor level of higher education, the student has to defend a Bachelor thesis relevant to his/her research project. Upon completion of this level of studies, the student receives a Bachelor degree.

Master degree corresponds to 7th qualification level of National Qualifications Frameworks of Ukraine. Master studies at KhNUE last a year and a half (90 ECTS credits).

Master curriculum lists specialization courses that ensure epy development of the specific/subject competencies (40 ECTS credits); 4 major courses (electives) for Masters to acquire transferable competencies (20 ECTS credits) and internship program.

Students undertake a research project within the KhNUE, where they are required to plan and execute their own work. The projects include economic collaboration. Upon completion of the Master level of higher education, the student has to defend a Master thesis relevant to his/her research project.

Doctoral studies (PhD) last four years and are spent completing a research project for the award of PhD. Students also undertake further research skills training and subject specific training during Years 2-4 of the programme.

While cooperation between higher education institutions and employers is not formally regulated in Ukraine, the KhNUE organizes internship for students to gain experience through professional practice assignment together with a consulting project and an internship placement, both of which are conducted with private or public companies. Transferable skills training is a vital part of the intership program. Interactions with the economic entities are conducted through events, such as:

— workshops with invited guests;

— company visits;

— seminars with invited guests;

— yearly vacancy fairs;

— conferences;

social events, and more..

3.1.1. Overview of the HEI :

The internal QA of educational activity at KhNUE is based on the system of strategic planning, monitoring and self-evaluation at all levels of the university management structure. It is governed by the Regulations on internal quality assurance in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics.

31

3.1.3. QA Structure of KhNUE

The ensuring the quality of educational activities in KhNUE takes place at the level of:

— departments,

— dean's offices,

— corresponding departments as:

— department of quality assurance of education and innovative development,

— methodological and educational departments,

— department of post-graduate and doctoral studies,

— research and development.

QA structure is rather oriented on licensing and accreditation of education program. There is no quality assurance in terms of ESG.

3.1.4. QA Mechanisms

The internal QA of educational activity at KhNUE is based on the system of strategic planning, monitoring and self-evaluation at all levels of the university management structure. It is governed by the Regulations on internal quality assurance in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics.

The basic procedures of internal QA in KhNUE are as follows:

— the development of education quality indicators system according to priorities;

— the development and implementation of monitoring procedures to determine the dynamics of quality assurance in educational processes and outcomes;

— education quality self-evaluation by stakeholders of the educational process at all management levels;

— the conducting of marketing and monitoring research to determine the labor market needs as well as the requirements of stakeholders;

— the conducting of socio-psychological studies to analyze the quality of educational services and level of satisfaction from them;

— the assessment of the activities results to stimulate and motivate the participants of educational process for continual quality enhancement.

Internal quality assurance procedures implemented by KhNUE are in line:

— with Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area which have an impact on QA policy, the design of education programs, student-oriented learning, student assessment, admission requirements, students' progress, certification, the selection criteria applicable to teaching staff, educational resources and students' consulting, knowledge management, public outreach, constant monitoring and expertise of education programs, external QA procedures.

3.1.5. QA Strategy

KhNUE has own policy to assure internal quality of the Degrees delivered. It has public character and is a part of KhNUE strategic management. The main priorities, guidelines and indicators of the internal quality assurance of scientific and educational activities are identified by Conceptual Development Framework of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics till 2020, as well as Strategic Development Plan of Kharkiv National University of Economics for 2013 - 2020.

Education quality assurance in KhNUE takes place at the department (chair) level, dean's offices and administrative departments such as department of education quality assurance and innovative development, methodological and educational departments, department of post-graduate and doctoral studies, research and development).

1) **Stakeholders** (all internal actors – students, administrative and researchers are engaged in QA as well as external stakeholders, in which areas);

Administrative and academic staff:

2) **QA Procedures** (official statues of academic administration procedures, personnel procedures and codes of practice, educational process etc.).

Development of educational programs are carried out in

accordance with the Standards of Higher Education:

— verification of compliance with the basic conditions (public needs,

— external stakeholder consultation, etc.);

— definition of a profile of an educational program;

— description of the purpose of the program and the final results of education;

— determination of general and professional competencies;

— development of curriculum;

— development of modules and teaching methods;

— definition of approaches to training and assessment methods;

— development of a system for assessing the quality of an educational program with a view to its improvement.

Educational programs of the University have two components - the regulatory and variable. The regulatory component ensures the development of professional level competencies (compulsory minimum experience in solving professional tasks), and the variable component - is responsible for ensuring competencies in accordance with modern development requirements (expansion and deepening of the level of education in different directions: general, fundamental, special). Students have possibility to choose variable components according to their needs and interests.

The internal education QA system in KhNUE implies the implementation of the QA procedures and activities according to following directions:

1. Quality management of the educational activity and development of the university.

2. Quality of educational programs. Development, approval, monitoring and

periodic review of educational programs.

3. Quality of the teaching staff. Improvement of academic staff qualification.

4. Student-centered learning, teaching and evaluation of students.

5. Academic culture. Prevention and Detection of Academic plagiarism.

6. Educational resources and student support. Availability of the necessary resources for the educational process.

7. Information management. Availability of information systems for effective management of the educational process.

8. Public information.

9. Cyclical external quality assurance.

3.1.6. Internal QA documents

1. Regulations on internal quality assurance in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Polozhennya-pro-VZYaO-15.07.2016.pdf

2. Conceptual Development Framework of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics till 2020. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/zasadu.pdf

3. Strategic Development Plan of Kharkiv National University of Economics for 2013-2020. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Strategic-Plan-HNEU-2013-2020-years.pdf

4. Methodical approaches to the formation of the variable component of educational programs in Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Metodychni-pidhody-do-formuvannya-variatyvnoyi-skladovoyi-osvitnih-prohram-1.pdf

5. Rules of admission students to the Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics in 2017. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/Conditions_of_admission_to_universities

6. Temporary provision for assessment of learning outcomes based on the accumulated rating system. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymchasove-polozhennya-Pro-poryadok-otsinyuvannya-rezultativ-navchannya-studentiv.pdf

7. Regulations on conducting written examinations at the Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/POLOZHENNYA-pro-provedennya-pys%CA%B9movyh-ekzameniv-u-HNEU.pdf

8. Regulation on the organization of the educational process in the credit-module system of specialists training in KhNUE. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymchasove-po lozhennya-pro-orhanizatsiyu-osvitnoho-protsesu-v-HNEU.pdf

9. Regulation on the certification of graduates of the Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics. Available in Ukrainian at:

http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Polozhennya-pr o-atestatsiyu-vypusknykiv-HNEU.pdf

10. Quantitative assessment methodology of teachers' scientific and pedagogical activity in the University / comp. Ponomarenko V.S., Afanasyev M.V., Yermachenko V.Y., others. – Kharkiv : Publishing House of KhNUE, 2012. – 32 p.

3.1.7. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
ESG 1.1			
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality?	✅		Conceptual Framework of Development of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics till 2020, as well as Strategic Plan of Development of Kharkiv National Economic University for 2013-2020. http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Strategic-Plan-H NEU-2013-2020-years.pdf
Does the institution promote quality culture?	✅		An approved Code of Ethics 2008 http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Kodeks-profesiyn oyi-etyky.pdf
If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?		❌	
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?		❌	KhNUE has not: the Committee on ethics and academic unity; Rules of Procedure of the Committee; Annual reports on the activities of the Committee on ethics
ESG 1.2			
Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?	✅		The programs are developed in accordance with HEI strategy A set of documents for each program offered by the institution that includes: objectives of the program, a description of the qualification, a description of professional competencies obtained after graduation, the curricula of the specialties, the training programs of the courses included in the curriculum, teaching methods, and final assessment, minimum standard requirements for graduation, opportunities for internships. http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Polozhennya-pro-VZYaO-15.07.2016.pdf

Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?	(green)		Only surveys of the level of interest of students in being trained in educational programs. Twice a year the department of quality assurance of education and innovative development conducts an anonymous survey of the level of satisfaction/dissatisfaction of applicants with the quality of educational process and scientific activity
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?		(pink)	Mainly Not

ESG 1.3

Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?		(pink)	
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?		(pink)	
Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?	(green)		Distribution of the credits in the curricula among the compulsory and elective courses. 25% of ECTS are for elective courses in each bachelor & master degree program. Introducing in the curricula of elective courses of various categories - Minor, Major and Mag-Minor. The regulation for conducting production internships and practical training for the corresponding degrees.
The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance	(green)		A system of testing procedures (incl. examinations and diploma thesis defense) is officially published, including the criteria and methods of verification and assessment and the criteria for assigning a numerical score.
Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;	(green)		Temporary provisions "About the order of evaluation of results Students 'training for academic Balanced rating system " http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymchasove-polozhennya-Pro-poryadok-otsinyuvannya-rezultativ-navchannya-studentiv.pdf
Is there a procedure for students appeals?	(green)		In Temporary provisions "About the order of evaluation of results Students 'training for academic Balanced rating system http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/Tymchasove-polozhennya-Pro-poryadok-otsinyuvannya-rezultativ-navchannya-studentiv.pdf

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admission?	(green)		Regulations on the learning activities, governing the issues from enrolling to the students' graduation. Rules for the recognition of study periods at other HEI based on the transfer of credits (ECTS). http://www.hneu.edu.ua/Conditions_of_admission_to_universities
Are there regulations for student progression?	(green)		Regulation "On the Procedure for Formation of the Student Achievement Ranking for the students of the KhNUE for the appointment of academic scholarships" Monitoring of Learning Outcomes http://www.hneu.edu.ua/Monitoring_of_learning_outcomes_2017-2018 http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2017/Polozhennya-pro-poryadok-formuvannya-reytynhu-uspishnosti-studentiv-1.pdf

Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?			KhNUE has adopted and disclosed rules for academic recognition of study and practice periods abroad, related to students' mobility carried out according to contracts with foreign HEI and European education and training programs. Students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies. http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2017/OPYS-dokumentiv-pro--vyshchu-osvitu-derzh-zrazka.pdf http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2016/POLOZHENNYA-pro-poryadok-zamovlennya-vydachi-ta-obliku-dokumentiv-pro-vyshchu-osvitu-v-HNEU.pdf
Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			Annual survey in order to study the quality of the internal educational environment, satisfaction with the quality of providing educational services, requirements of the labor market for specialists with higher education http://www.hneu.edu.ua/Student_Survey_2017-2018

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?			Provisions on the certification of teaching staff (formal document) http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2015/Polozhennya_pro_atestatsiyu_pedahohichnykh_pratsivnykiv.pdf
Are there fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment of staff?			A formal announcement of the vacancy position contest, which includes only the title of the position and the number http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2018/Ogoloshennya-16.pdf
Do the University support teachers development?			Teaching staff involved in forms of continuing education related to professional career.Teaching staff involved in international mobility http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2015/Polozhennya_pro_atestatsiyu_pedahohichnykh_pratsivnykiv.pdf http://www.hneu.edu.ua/International_certification

ESG 1.6

Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?			Plans for the development of the material, technical and information facilities and the center for distance learning https://pns.hneu.edu.ua/ library and information network at the university http://library.hneu.edu.ua/ Regulations on the administrative services for students
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?			Human resources from the academic staff (tutors, course instructors) to support and facilitate students' orientation in education Administrative staff to support student mobility between higher education institutions.

ESG 1.7

Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?			The University's corporate information management system contains the following subsystems: Functional subsystems of the corporate information system: Entry Campaign Management System. Human Resources System. The management of financial and economic activities. the management of the educational process. Document management system.

ESG 1.8

Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?		KhNUE website (http://www.hneu.edu.ua) Information about international activities: - Cooperation with foreign universities; - Opportunities for exchange of students, academic and administrative staff; - Granted joint degree programs 2. Minutes, reports and decisions of seminars, debates and discussions on the programming documents and academic records, decisions and audit results related to the quality of training of students and academic staff from academic and faculty councils and other university forums with the participation of representatives of students, trade unions and consumer organizations 3. Minutes of meetings of the management bodies of HEI, which contain discussions and decisions about opening new professional fields and specialties for training in relevant educational and qualification degrees 4. Regulations for conducting research and other activities inherent double diplomas.

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?		The teaching programs of each studied cycle on Moodle https://pns.hneu.edu.ua/
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?		Unformally
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?		

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?		Annual report on the fulfillment of mandatory criteria for the provision and confirmation of the status of a national institution of higher education http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/public/moved/hneu/About_university/Dokumenty/2018/Richnyy-zvit-HNEU-2017.pdf

3.1.8. Conclusions

EDUQAS project is grounded on the results obtained from the previous projects University support in improving internal QA procedures, Optimization of QA in universities, Institutional Research for efficient university governance and quality improvement of AUF seeking to develop self-evaluation tools as an answer to common needs and problems of Eastern european HEIs. The overal goal of the projects is to pass from the logic of competition to the logic of cooperation between HEIs in Central and Eastern Europe in the field of QA by strengthening their development strategies.

Firstly, projects allowed all participants to present and share information on their quality assurance systems and bring together actors in Central, Eastern Europe and Western Europe.

Secondly, projects members had the opportunity to analyze the best practices of the European Union in the field of quality assurance and to define common principles for the final edition of a methodological guide on quality assurance (6 conferences and seminars, sections on the scientific topic, articles and theses).

Thirdly, universities have created a Facebook page and a collaborative platform (based on Google) that provide the information on improving the quality culture and implementation of action plans in partner universities.

Fourthly, project members have developed a methodological guide for quality assurance in order to develop a culture of quality and taking into account the specifics of each university (methodological guide and quality assessment indicators)

Chapter 2.
Lviv Polytechnic National University

3.2.1. Overview of the HEI

Brief description: fields of study, list of specialties, number of academic staff, researches, students/graduates, list of international projects, list of partners, other important ratios, position at international ranking systems, current strategy of HEIs development.

Lviv Polytechnic National University (LPNU http://lp.edu.ua/en) is the largest university in Western Ukraine. The University traces its

roots from Imperial-Royal Real School in Lviv founded in 1816 that soon became a well-known scientific, intellectual and educational centre, the place where national culture, freedom and democracy were cherished.

LPNU consists of 16 institutesas well as the Institute of Distance Education and the International Institute of Education, Culture and Relations with Diaspora, including 107 academic departments, has about 36,000 students, 600 PhD candidates. The educational process is provided by a faculty of about 2356academic staff members, 350 of whom are professors (holding Dr.Sc. degree) and over 1290 associate professors (holding Ph.D. degree).

Lviv Polytechnic is one of the biggest universities in Ukraine. The University total enrollment in 2018 is 27633 students.

LPNU has numerous educational programmes both in engineering and social and behavioral sciences (http://lp.edu.ua/en/education/majors). 2-cycle system of education (bachelor and master cycles) according to Bologna process is introduced at LPNU. There are 64 Bachelor programmes (20000 students) and 129 Master programmes (7000 students). At present according to the new Ukrainian Law "On higher education" the process of development of new 3rd cycle programmes covering all major engineering specialties as well as some humanitarian and science programmes is going on.In 2016 there were opened 37 new specialties and 54 PhD specialties were licensed. Lviv Polytechnic holds the first place in Ukraine as to the number of licensed postgraduate specialties.

The leading academic institutes with the largest number of students are: Institute of Economics and Management, Institute of Computer Science and Information Technologies, Institute of Jurisprudence and Psychology and Institute of Computer Technologies, Automation and Metrology.

Since 1961 LPNU welcomes international students and at presnt there are more than 300 students from 20 countries. The main mechanism for the implementation of international cooperation is scientific research, educational and culturalcollaboration based on 100 package agreements on cooperation inthe field of science and education with over 75 leading universitiesand research institutions and companies in Europe, America and Asia. University is a member of the following international organizations: Magna Charta Universitatum; European University Association, Alliance of Univer-

sities for Democracy, Association of Carpathian Region Universities, Board of European Students of Technology; Association des EtatsGénéraux des Etudiants de l'Europe / European Students' Forum. At the moment LPNU is a member of four Erasmus+KA2 projects: EDUQAS (Implementation of Education Quality Assurance system via cooperation of University-Business-Government in HEIs), MASTIS (Establishing Modern Master-level Studies in Information Systems), DocHub (Structuring Cooperation in Doctoral Research, Transferable Skills Training, and Academic Writing Instruction in Ukraine's Regions) and SmaLog (Master in Smart Transport and Logistics for Cities).

Lviv Polytechnic is doing research according to priority areas of science and technology development in Ukraine. Annually, scientific staff of the university perform over 50 scientific research works, gain grants of the President of Ukraine to support young scientists (Candidates and Doctors of Sciences), implement common projects under interstate agreements (international projects under the auspice of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine). Every year over 300 research works are conducted at the University under business contracts with estimated funding of over 10 mln UAH. Annual funding of scientific research works exceeds 20 mln UAH. The University publishes 36 scientific periodicals, 14 of them being scientific journals (10 in English). "Chemistry and Chemical Technology" journal in English is listed in Scopus scientometric database. Every year university scientists publish more than 4500 scientific papers. Almost 2500 articles are published in professional editions, about 700 articles – in editions included into scientometric databases.

3.2.2. Presentation of the HEI QA system

The main objects of the QA system at the University are: organization of educational process, design and approval of programmes, student admission, progression, recognition and certification scientific activity, PhD studies, information and library provision of students and teaching staff, teaching staff, etc.

LPNU has separate unit responsible for QA. Currently four people are working at the Unit.

3.2.3. QA Structure of LPNU

The main aim of the Unit is to implement University policy of educational services in QA and practical implementation of such policy.

The following functions are accomplished by the Unit:

— Development of suggestions and projects of documents for rector and the University Council to improve the University legislation in QA;
— Participation in improvement of the University department ratings, evaluation of the University academics and monitoring of teaching process;
— Gathering, analysis and generalization of information at the University;
— Auditing the University department activity;
— Analysis of student grades and the activity of State Examination Commissions;
— Auditing the University department readiness to the academic year;
— Analysis of the University academics evaluation;
— Registration of teaching guidelines and issuing quality certificates;
— Organization of control for student residual knowledge;
— Organization of work for defining department ratings;
— Organization of studentsolympiad, gathering and processing of student olympiad results.

3.2.4. QA Mechanisms

The mechanisms for ensuring the quality of education at the University are currently under development.QA mechanism mainly focused on ensuring education quality in the following directions:

1) indicators for department assessment - Internal code on department (http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/9858/polozhennya_pro_kafedru_nacionalnogo_universytetu_lvivska_politehnika.pdf). Department's assessment is carried each year by internal commission (which consists of representatives of other departments, deans and director of institute). It lays in checking certain documents.

2) indicators for academic staff assessment – Internal code on evaluation of the work of scientific and pedagogical workers of the department and determination of their ratings (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-ocinyuvannya-roboty-naukovo-pedagogichnyh-pracivnykiv) and Internal code on the material encouragement of scientific and pedagogical, pedagogical, scientific and engineering workers and doctoral students of LPNU (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-materialne-zaohochennya). Academic staff assessment is based on personal self-assessment in the following directions: teaching hours, methodological work, scientific work and organizational activity.

3) approval of educational programs – conducted once per 5 years by scientific-methodical commission of certain department and scientific-methodical council of the institute. Scientific-methodical commission consists of 8 members which are the following: the head of the department, secretary and 6 academics. Scientific-methodical council of the institute consists of the director of the institute, secretary of the institute, head of each department, which belongs to institute and heads of each scientific-methodical commission within institute.

1) Assessment of student's residual knowledge which is carried out on the following semester after the course was taught (http://www.lp.edu.ua/vsuya/organizaciya-provedennya-kontrolyu-zalyshkovyh-znan-studentiv).

3.2.5. QA Strategy

Lviv Polytechnic National University (LPNU) elaborated "Program of LPNU Development till 2020", which highlights key aspects of internal quality assurance implementations. According to this Program LPNU is using Ukrainian Law in the field of Higher Education (2014), ISO 9001:2009 and ESG standards for development and implementation QA strategy.

At the moment for this purpose LPNU has elaborated the following items:

1) Internal Guidelines (about 90):

1.1. Guidelines about the system of internal QA at LPNU (13/02/17);

1.2. Rectors Order about elaboration and implementation quali-

ty management system according to ISO 9001:2015 (02/04/18);

1.3.   Rectors Order about appointing responsible people for supporting quality management system in each institute/department (15/06/18);

1.4.   Numerous Guidelines insuring teaching and learning process, research and international activity, material and technical support, informational support, academic staffand students contingent.

Nowadays LPNU Developing Strategy till 2030 is being on early stages of elaborating and it will be more focused on implementation international QA standards.

2)   Stakeholders (all internal actors – students, administrative and researches are engaged in QA as well as external stakeholders, in which areas);

Mostly IT educational programs at Masters level are developed involving the stakeholders. They are:

•Internet of Things

•Artificial Intelligence

•Information System

Educational program "Internet of Things" was developed and is delivered in cooperation with IT-cluster. Students of educational program "Artificial Intelligence" have two scientific advisors: one from the University and one from the company. Two-year Mastersprogram in Information Technologies was elaborated in cooperation with representatives of the IT companies and alumni from IT field/

QA Procedures (official statues ofacademic administration procedures, personnel procedures and codes of practice, educational process etc.).

The main document which shed the light upon QA at LPNU is Code on Internal Quality Assurance System of Educational Activity at LPNU (13/02/17). The main points are the following:

1)   Rector, Vise Rectors, Deans, Chiefs of the departments are responsible for implementation internal QA;

2)   Internal QA system is consist of two parts: estimation

monitoring and management of educational activity quality insuring procedures;

3) Policy of LPNU of quality assurance of educational activity and higher education, which is a part of University strategy;

4) Student centered learning – possibility for students to choose courses, studying individual schedule, students government, usage innovative informational technologies etc;

5) Internal Standards of educational activity and higher education QA which covers main aspects of university life – forming and approval educational programs, educational plans, academic staff work load, student centered learning, academic mobility ets. (in total 94).

3.2.6. Internal QA documents

LPNU according to Rectors Order (http://www.lp.edu.ua/nakaz-pro-zatverdzhennya-polozhen-syste-my-upravlinnya-yakistyu-ta-pro-pidrozdily-universytetu) is developing the Quality Management System and the university and its departments.

For this purpose the following codes of practice were elaborated:

1. Internal Code on the quality management system of LPNU.

2. Internal Code on risk management at LPNU.

3. Internal Code on information management at LPNU.

4. Internal Code on internal audits procedures at LPNU

5. Instruction for quality management responsible personof LPNU.

6. Internal Code onthe Information Support Center of LPNU

7. Internal Code onthe Center for Testing and Knowledge Diagnostics at LPNU.

8. Internal Code on Laboratory of Management of the Higher Education Institutionof LPNU.

9. Internal Code onthe teaching and methodological departmentof LPNU.

10. Internal Code on of the department for ensuring the func-

tioning of the quality management systemof LPNU.

11. Internal Code on creating organizational department and information support for the formation of the contingent of student-sof LPNU.

12. Internal Code onthe monitoring and operational planning department ofLPNU

13. Internal Code on employment department and relations with business of LPNU.

3.2.7. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
ESG 1.1			
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality?			-Code on Internal Quality Assurance System of Educational Activity at LPNU (13/02/17). http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/7902/ polozhennya_pro_systemu13-27.pdf It describes QA standards at LPNU including those presented in ESG 2015. However, mechanisms and procedures need to be improved. - "Program of LPNU Development till 2020", which highlights key aspects of internal quality assurance implementations
Does the institution promote quality culture?			Currently, LPNU is implementing quality management system according to ISO 9001:2015 (02/04/18), which means that all the University departments should be evaluated based on the particular requirements
If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?			- QA is a part "Program of LPNU Development till 2020", - In the Code on Internal Quality Assurance System of Educational Activity at LPNU (13/02/17) it is stated that the University QA policy is a part of the University strategic management (part 3 of the Code)
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?			LPNU has separate unit responsible for QA. However the procedures applied by this Unit needs to be modernized and updated in accordance to ESG 2015

ESG 1.2

Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?			It is regulated by the Code on development, approval and modernization of educational programs of LPNU was adopted in 2017 http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/de-fault/files/attach/2018/10336/polozhennya_pro_formuvannya_zatverdzhennya_ta_onovlennya_osvitnih_program_v_nacionalnomu_universyteti_lvivska_politehnika.pdf
Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?			Code on development, approval and modernization of educational programs of LPNU was adopted in 2017 http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/10336/polozhennya_pro_formuvannya_zatverdzhennya_ta_onovlennya_osvitnih_program_v_nacionalnomu_universyteti_lvivska_politehnika.pdf
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?			- QA is a part "Program of LPNU Development till 2020", - In the Code on Internal Quality Assurance System of Educational Activity at LPNU (13/02/17) it is stated that the University QA policy is a part of the University strategic management (part 3 of the Code)

ESG 1.3

Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?			
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?			Younger University professors are encouraging students to take an active role in learning process. However, currently such approach is quite limited.
Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?			Internal Code on the formation and implementation of individual student curricular (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-formuvannya-ta-real-izaciyu-indyvidualnyh-navchalnyh-planiv-studentiv) is adopted at LPNU. Students can choose up to 25% of their Curricular according to the Law on Higher Education of Ukraine.

The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance			Courses syllabus, which include criteria for and method of assessment are placed in Virtual Learning Environment of LPNU at the beginning of the semester (http://vns.lpnu.ua/login/index.php)
Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;			Courses syllabus, which include criteria for and method of assessment are placed in Virtual Learning Environment of LPNU at the beginning of the semester (http://vns.lpnu.ua/login/index.php)
Is there a procedure for students appeals?			The students can discuss their grades with the professor after the exam.

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admission?			The Rules of Admission of LPNU are adopted every year and are based on Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine regulations. http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2016/172/pravyla_2018_rik_zi_zminamy_20718_3.pdf
Are there regulations for student progression?			The organization of exams is conducted according to the Code on Rating Evaluation of Student Achievements http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2016/1677/11_polozhennya_pro_reytyngove_ocinyuvannya-148-156.pdf
Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?			This is the requirement of Law on Higher Education of Ukraine (2014). The diploma supplement describes the qualification gained by students
Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			The only exception is Collecting student's feedbacks via «Questionnaire for enrolled students». The information about expectations from studying of newly enrolled students is collected

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?			
Are there fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment of staff?			We have the Code of selecting staff for vacant positions at LPNU http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/9710/7_pro_konkurs_.pdf It describes the requirements necessary to occupy relevant positions.
Do the University support teachers development?			Currently, the following documents are regulating teacher's development. - Code on LPNU staff development http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/9711/8_pro_pidvyshchennya.pdf LPNU is encouraging international cooperation of its staff. The Code on students, PhD students, academic staff and post docs academic mobility was adopted. http://www.lp.edu.ua/sites/default/files/attach/2018/9934/33_polozhennya_pro_mobilnist_last_version_18.01.17.pdf

ESG 1.6

Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?			1. Internal Code on financial stimulation of teaching staff, staff and doctoral students (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-materialne-zaohochennya) – financial stimulation of teaching staff, staff and doctoral students. 2. Internal Code on scholarship for students and postgraduates (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-stypendialne-zabezpechennya-0) - financial motivation of students, and postgraduate students.
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?			1. Internal Code for Information Center (http://www.lp.edu.ua/nakaz-pro-zatverdzhennya-polozhen-systemy-upravlinnya-yakistyu-ta-pro-pidrozdily-universytetu) – university training site, computer labs, information network and Internet access are discribed. 2. Code on students, PhD students, academic staff and post docs academic mobility (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-akademichnu-mobilnist), (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-poryadok-vidboru-na-navchannya-studentiv-ta-aspirantiv) – mobility opportunity are described. 3. Internal Code for a teacher-curator (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-vykladacha-kuratora) - curators support students in developing individual curricular. 4. Internal Code on the formation and implementation of individual student curricular (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-formuvannya-ta-realizaciyu-indyvidualnyh-navchalnyh-planiv-studentiv) - the shift towards student-centered learning and flexible modes of learning was made. 5. Internal Code study course selection by students (http://www.lp.edu.ua/poryadok-vyboru-navchalnyh-dyscyplin-studentamy-nacionalnogo-universytetu-lvivska-politehnika) –professional, educational and cultural needs and interests of students are considered. 6. Internal Code for the Scientific and Technical Library http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-naukovo-tehnichnu-biblioteku - The Code was adopted to support student access to academic literature. 7. Internal Code on teaching in foreign languages (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-vykladannya-inozemnymy-movamy) Internal Code on presenting bachelor and master thesis in foreign language (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-zahyst-studentamy-kursantamy-ta-eksternamy) - possibility to defend thesis in foreign language. 8. Internal Code on Educational and Advisory Centers (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-navchalno-konsultatyvni-centry), Internal Code of the Institute of Distance Education (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-instytut-dystanciynogo-navchannya) – the Code was adopted to support part-time employed students.

ESG 1.7

Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?		1. Collecting student's feedbacks via «Questionnaire for enrolled students». 2. Analysis of the degree and intensity of use of software products and tools by teachers and students.

ESG 1.8

Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?		1. Internal Code on the university website (http://www.lp.edu.ua/ polozhenn-ya-pro-veb-sayt) – publishing information about educational programmes and course descriptions on university web-site. 2. Access to the leading scientific databases. Scopus, Web of Science and EBSCO. 3. On LPNU web-site there is so called "Opportunity Bank" of student activities and international opportunities (http://www.lp.edu.ua/ opportunities)

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?		The Internal Code on scientific and educational Council (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-naukovo-metodychnu-radu) – revise educational programmes once per year at each department.
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?		1. Internal Code on the educational council in the educational-scientific institute (department) (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-metodychnu-radu-navchal-no-naukovogo-instytutu) – revise educational programmes once per year in the department.
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?		Students are members of the Academic Council, which approves educational programs

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?		

3.2.8. Conclusions

It is worth mentioning that mostly young teachers and researchers are using principles of student-centered education in teaching process.

Such teachers are using the following student-centered approaches: problem-based approach, flipped learning and application of new information technologies.

International programs developed as a part of Erasmus+ KA2 projects are in most cases built on the principles of student-centered education.

1. MASTIS project. Two-year Masters program in Information Technologies

2. DocHub project. Modernization of PhD programs in "Management", "Computer Sciences" and "Education policy".

Strengths

— LPNU possesses QA policy, which includes ESG 2015 standards.

— LPNU QA policy is the part of the University strategic management.

Weaknesses

— QA mechanisms and procedures are underdeveloped and often formal. Their current sense contradicts to the essence of ESG 2015 standards.

— Students and other stakeholders are not strongly involved in the QA processes such as building educational programs and giving feedback on quality of educational process.

— The use of modern pedagogical methods and methods of delivery are limited.

— The procedure of student appeals should be developed.

Chapter 3.
Donetsk State University of Management

3.3.1. Overview of the HEI

Donetsk State University of Management (DSUM) (the foundation date is 1992) is a higher education institution, which prepares students at bachelor, master and PhD levels.

In the pre-war period, the university was among the top three of the country's most pro-active economic educational establishments. More than 7,000 students studied at the university, the structure consisted of 5 faculties, 23 departments, and more than 30 specialties. DSUM was fully financed.

In 2014, due to a military conflict, the University was moved to Mariupol (120 km from Donetsk, which is currently a front-line zone). The university was not able to take equipment, educational literature and materials; in most cases it was not possible to even get files and documents from university computers. In the new city, the process started from scratch. Currently, 1,073 students study at the university, there are 3 faculties in the structure of the university, 14 departments (11 of them are graduating ones), 150 academic teaching staff, including 34 doctors of sciences, 64 candidates of sciences.

There are the following specialties at the University: Economics; Management; Social work; Sociology; Law; Marketing; Accounting and Taxation; HR; Computer Science; Tourism; Finance, Banking and Insurance; Public administration.

There are PhD and doctoral degrees at the University. There is a specialized academic council with the right to defend theses for obtaining the degree of a doctor (candidate) of state administration in the specialty "Mechanisms of Public Administration". The University publishes 2 scientific magazines "Manager" and "Prometheus", 2 collections of scientific papers.

In the structure of the University there is a separate unit - Ugledarsky College (prepares for bachelor degree).

Every year more than 50 trainings are conducted by the university staff of DSUM, including in foreign educational institutions. By 2018, there are 7 international projects under the Erasmus +, Jean

Monnet, British Council and others programs.

During 2015-2018, in terms of Erasmus+ Academic Mobility Programs, 18 students have completed their one-semester internship at Partner Universities.

The main international projects of the university over the past 5 years are:

EDUQAS project "Implementation of the quality assurance system through university-business-government cooperation" under the Erasmus + KA2 program;

ELITE project "Education for Leadership, Intellectual and Creative Development" under the TEMPUS program;

CTAE project "Creation of a Third Age Education Center" (CTAE) under the TEMPUS program.

Jean Monnet Center of Excellence at DSUM;

Jean Monet Department "Analysis and application of the European experience of democracy and good governance in Ukraine";

British Council program "Development of Leadership Potential of Ukrainian Universities";

UNDP project "Community Based Approach to Local Development";

Two Erasmus + KA1 projects.

EMBER academic mobility project under the Erasmus Mundus program

Currently, the university has problems with the material provision of the educational process: lack of classrooms, laboratories, libraries, dormitories for students and teaching staff, gyms, catering establishments, leisure facilities.

Meanwhile, the teaching staff together with the students is making significant efforts to promote the brand of "Donetsk State University of Management", to develop international cooperation, community involvement in initiatives conducted by DSUM, to demonstrate a high level of social responsibility (provides non-formal education services for the elderly people free of charge and without being paid), to support initiatives of local self-government bodies.

The University finishes the formation of a development strategy in the new environment, the basis of which is the ecologization of educational establishment in Mariupol and adjusts its vision.

3.3.2. Presentation of the HEI QA system

Since September 1st, 2017, the Department of Education Quality of Donetsk State University of Management has started its functioning.

The main tasks of the Department of Education Quality are related to the modernization of the internal system of quality assurance in accordance with the requirements of the new Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education".

3.3.3. QA Structure

The Department of Education Quality consists of 3 employees: Head of the Department and two specialists. Currently, the quality of education department is organized in close cooperation with the teaching and Curriculum & Instruction Department, dean's offices; the procedures for differentiating the functions of the heads and employees of the departments, the de-bureaucracy of activities, and attempts to establish on-line communication and electronic accounting of students' achievements have been continuing to be improved. The department members increase their qualification at trainings and workshops. Recently, there is a need in advisory functions on the implementation of ESG standards, the dissemination of best foreign and national experience while specialists' training are conducted by Department of Education Quality.

3.3.4. QA Mechanisms

The mechanisms for ensuring the quality of education at the University are currently under development. The consequence of the transition is the use of "old" quality indicators (mostly formal and quantitative, identified during the previous external accreditation procedures) and the implementation of "new", related to competent and student-centered approaches to learning.

In the system of current indicators there is a clear imbalance between objective and subjective indicators, the latter are not sufficiently involved, which testifies to the uneven involvement of

students and employers, in the formation of mechanisms for assessing the education quality. Mechanisms for ensuring the education quality are still characterized by universality. The difference in the quality control procedures at the master level is the public defence of thesis / qualification papers and the obligatory results approbation of thesis / qualification papers in the form of student's presentations at conferences, participation in scientific contests, publications).

3.3.5. QA Strategy

The strategy of education quality control at DSUM is under development. Currently, the tasks for the working group are defined, consultations are held with the administration of the University, with representatives of the municipality regarding the coordination of the current "Strategy for DSUM Development 2016-2022" (http://dsum.edu.ua/upload/doc/strategy2017.pdf), which, after moving to Mariupol, is overcoming the crisis manifestations in its activities and is actively integrating into the local educational space and the labour market, aligning with the "Development Strategy of Mariupol-2021" (https://mariupolrada.gov.ua/uploads/ckeditor/Economy/Strategy%202021/Strategy-2021-UKR% 20% 283% 29.pdf).

The study and publication of the Standards and Recommendations on Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) among the general public and students of Donetsk State University of Management are being held and made public.

The main strategic objectives of the internal quality assurance system in higher education at DSUM are reflected in the working paper "The Provision on the Quality Assurance System of Higher Education at DSUM" (https://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/Положення-про-систему-забезпечення-якісті-вищої-освіти.pdf); "Regulations on Academic Integrity at Donetsk State University of Management" (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/Положення-про-академічну-доброчесність-у-ДонДУ.pdf).

The current "Internal Quality Assurance System for Higher Education of DSUM (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Система-внутрішнього-забезпечення-якості-освітньої-діяльностіу-ДонДУУ-.pdf) allows implementing the following

operational tasks:

— update the normative and legal and methodological basis for ensuring the educational activities quality at the University;

— monitor the education content;

— monitor the training approaches, resource potential of the University and resource and process management;

— monitor the state of the socio-psychological environment of the University;

— ensure transparency of educational activities, disclosure of information on its results on DSUM website;

— develop the recommendations for improving the educational activities quality.

Stakeholders (all internal actors – students, administrative staff and researches are engaged in QA as well as external stakeholders, in which areas)

The range of DSUM stakeholders in Mariupol has expanded by establishing cooperation with public organizations and the municipality: in particular, on solving the social consequences of the military conflict and the prospects for tourist industry development. The established contacts create opportunities for improving the content of educational programs in the areas of "Sociology" and "Tourism" through these areas of training the graduates' competences assessment by stakeholders. All university activities are oriented on the internal and external labour markets requirements for graduates with appropriate professional competence, value orientation, and social orientation.

At present, there are activities on the distribution of responsibilities between different management levels (DSUM, faculty, department, student self-government body) in order to identify the needs / expectations of external and internal stakeholders, establish feedback links with graduates and employers.

3.1.6. Internal QA documents

The main objects of the quality management system at the University are: organization of educational process, scientific activity, PhD studies, information and library provision of students and teaching staff, lecturers' training, remuneration system and employee incentives for achievements, office work and circulation of documents, economic maintenance and material and technical support, measures for the employees' rights protection, etc.

There are 14 departments that provide organizational, methodological, informational and technical support for training in full-time, distance learning, research, international relations, financial and economic, accounting activities at DSUM.

Nowadays, at DSUM, the responsibility levels at faculties, departments and other structural units and relevant administrative staff and individuals for implementing quality assurance procedures are clearly defined, which is reflected in the current Provisions on the educational process (https://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/Положення-про-освітній-процес-1.pdf), the rectorl (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Положеня-про-ректорат.pdf); faculties (http://dsum.edu.ua/upload/doc/polojennya/poloj_management.pdf; http://dsum.edu.ua/upload/doc/polojennya/poloj_pravo.pdf; http://dsum.edu.ua/upload/doc/polojennya/poloj_economika.pdf), departments (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Положення-про-кафедру.pdf), training department (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Положення-про-навчальний-відділ-1.pdf); student self-government (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/polozhennya_pro_organ_studentskogo_samovryaduvannya.pdf).

The quality control is implemented through internal audits. In particular, regarding the analysis of student learning outcomes, the procedure is as follows: in accordance with the rector's order, the dean's office prepares "Reports on the results of examinations and students' enrolment on full-time and part-time forms of study" for the semester and for the academic year, which contain a textual analysis of students' academic progress in comparison with the previous academic year, comparative tables, graphic materials.

Reports are provided to the training department, summarized and, after consideration by the university administration, are posted on the official DSUM website (https://dsum.edu.ua /документи/#1518698681507-c9410ff6-7422/ Підсумки навчання). In addition, according to the results of the qualifying examination, the department prepares reports on the qualification papers defence in compliance with the forms approved by the order of the rector of DSUM.

Reports are provided to the training department, where the information is analysed, summarized, presented in the table and is uploaded to the official website of DSUM (https://dsum.edu.ua/ документи-навчального-відділу/Інформація про складання екзаменів та захисту дипломних, магістерських робіт).

For the purpose of internal quality control of the "Specialist" training, the level of compliance with the requirements for professionals in the field of future professional activities, the level of compliance with the state requirements of the educational process organization at the departments, the degree of objectivity of the students' assessment by a particular lecturer; during the semester the rector's tests of students' knowledge are carried out at DSUM (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/up-loads/2015/11/Положення-про-організацію-та-проведення-ректорс ьких-контрольних-робіт-у-ДонДУУ-16.pdf.

The procedure for assessing the quality and revision of educational programs and the involvement of stakeholders, the creation of sectorial expert councils, is under development. While working out educational programs, projects of educational standards of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine are taken as the basis. The programs are developed by working groups (3 persons in each group) from among the leading teaching staff of the University approved by the University Academic Council.

On the basis of educational-professional (educational-scientific) specialization, a curriculum is developed for each specialty that defines the list and amount of academic disciplines in ECTS credits, the sequence of disciplines, the specific forms of conducting training sessions and their volume, the schedule of the educational process, forms of current and final assessment. In order to specify the educational process for each academic year planning, a working curriculum is drawn up, which is approved by the rector.

Curriculum and methodological recommendations are prepared separately for each Specialty and for each form of study. Curricula of disciplines are developed by departments in accordance with the requirements of the relevant educational programs of training specialists.

3.3.7. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
ESG 1.1			
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality	☐		In accordance with the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" at DSUM the policy is envisaged that assumes responsibility for quality assurance on behalf of the Faculties, Departments, Structural Units as well as on the level of the teaching members and students. The policy cultivates academic integrity and freedom, warns against academic fraud (plagiarism); and is designed to prevent intolerance of any type or discrimination against students or employees. However, this policy is not written in a separate document. Some of its elements are reflected in the Regulations on the Educational Process, the Regulations on the System of Quality Assurance in Higher Education at DSUM, the Regulations on the Assessment of Students' Knowledge, and the Regulations on Academic Integrity.
Does the institution promote quality culture?	☐		The mechanisms for the quality assurance at the University are currently under development. The consequence of the transition is the use of "old" quality indicators (mostly formal and quantitative) and the implementation of the "new" ones, related to the competence and student-centered approaches towards learning. In the system of valid indicators there is a clear imbalance between objective and subjective indicators; the latter are not sufficiently involved, indicating uneven involvement of stakeholders, i.e. students and employers, in the formation of mechanisms for assessing the quality of education. Mechanisms of the quality assurance are still characterized by universality.
If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?	☐		The strategy of quality control of education at DSUM is under development. The Strategy development will comply with the local labour market needs which are indicated in the municipal strategy document "Strategy of the development of Mariupol-2021". The study and publication of the Standards and Recommendations on Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) are disseminated among teaching and administrative staff and students. The main strategic objectives of the system of internal quality assurance of DSUM are reflected in the "Regulations on the system of quality assurance at DSUM". https://d-sum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/Положення-про-систему-забезпечення-якісті-вищої-освіти.pdf);
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?	☐		The Department of the Quality Assurance at Donetsk State University of Management has operated since September 1, 2017.

ESG 1.2

Question			Response
Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?			University on the basis of the educational-professional (educational and scientific) program, develops a curriculum for each specialty that defines the list and volume of academic disciplines in accordance with ECTS, the sequence of studying such disciplines, the specific forms of conducting training sessions and their volume, the schedule of the educational process, the forms of the current and final control. To specify the planning of the educational process for each academic year, a working curriculum is drawn up, which is approved by the rector. The curricula are prepared separately for each specialty and for each form of training (including full time and part time studies). Curricula of disciplines are developed by Departments in accordance with the requirements of the relevant study programs. After approval of the curriculum by the university's education-methodical council, it is approved by the decision of the academic council. The review of the study programs is based on the results of their monitoring. The criteria for reviewing educational programs are based on the feedback from teaching staff, students, graduates and employers, and as a result of forecasting the development of the industry and the needs of labour market. Responsible for implementation: major Departments, Department for Study Affairs, vice-rector for scientific and pedagogical work, Academic Council of the University. Indicators: the level of updating of educational programs, the level of participation of employers in the development and implementation of changes, the level of satisfaction of students (graduates), graduates employment index, international certification of educational programs, participation in international training programs, ranking according to employers' estimates.
Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?			Regulations on the organization of the educational process at DSUM, the Regulations on the system of quality assurance of education at DSUM. Methodical recommendations for the development of temporary educational programs at DSUM.
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?			In a new placement, in Mariupol, connection with the stakeholders is being re-established. Stakeholders by means of recommendations influenced the opening of new specializations, the introduction of disciplines of the sample cycle. The stakeholders' group in Mariupol for DSUM has expanded at the expense of establishing cooperation between DSUM and public organizations and the municipality. In particular, the established contacts create opportunities for improving the content of the study programs in "Sociology" and "Tourism" through the assessment by stakeholders of the competences of graduates of these areas of training.

ESG 1.3

Question			Response
Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?			The Regulation "On the system of quality assurance in higher education at DSUM" stipulates that every 5 years the teaching and administrative staff go through internal attestation. These procedures are held at the meetings of the Departments, which give a conclusion on the further tenure term for a teaching employee. The Assessment is made on the base of ranking indicators. The ranking methodology was developed and introduced at DSUM in 201. Now it needs substantial modernization. The assessment of lecturers' teaching skills is carried out through open lessons, and by peer assessment.
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?			Study programs, curricula are developed by major departments with the participation of representatives of minor departments. The representatives of student self-governance are engaged in the process.

Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?		Internal Code on the formation and implementation of individual student curricular (http://www.lp.edu.ua/polozhennya-pro-formuvannya-ta-real-izaciyu-indyvidualnyh-navchalnyh-planiv-studentiv) is adopted at LPNU. Students can choose up to 25% of their Curricular according to the Law on Higher Education of Ukraine.
The criteria for and method of assess-ment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance		Assessment of students' academic progress is carried out in accordance with the Regulation "On Assessment of the Knowledge of the Students at DSUM", the Regulation "On the Educational Process" (https://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/up-loads/2018/09/Statement-proschool-process -1.pdf). In the educational process, the following types of control of learning outcomes are used: entrance control, current control during semester, final work, individual tasks, coursework, and final semester control. Entrance control is carried out according to the tasks corresponding to the programs of preliminary training. Current control can be carried out in the form of oral questioning or written control at seminar, laboratory classes, lectures, in the form of a colloquium, presentations, and in the form of computer testing. The final semester control determines the degree of students' achievement of the planned learning outcomes determined by the curriculum. The maximum amount of points that a student can gain upon the final semester control is 100 points.
Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;		Assessment of the students' academic progress takes place in accordance with the Regulations "On the Assessment of Knowledge of the Students at DSUM". The objects of current control of students of all educational levels are determined. The areas of responsibility for assessing the students' progress of any educational level and ensuring quality at the levels are specified by the academic council, administration, Department, dean's offices, student self-government bodies, as well as are within the competencies of vice-rectors, deans, heads of departments, teaching members, students.
Is there a procedure for students appeals?		The Regulation "On the organization of the educational process at DSUM" stipulates that a student must be acquainted with the results of examination written work not later than within 3 working days after the exam takes place. A student has the right to get acquainted with the audited work and to receive an explanation of the evaluation mark received. In case of disagreement with the evaluation, a student has the right to file a written appeal on the day of the announcement of the assessment to the Head of the department, indicating the specific reasons for disagreement with the assessment. The Head of the Department together with the examiner, involving, if necessary, other specialists, within 3 days, examines the appeal and respond the student about the results of their auditing.

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admis-sion?		The application rules at DSUM are updated annually, after the announcement of the application rule of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, then they are approved by the Academic Council of DSUM and are published on the university website (https://dsum.edu.ua / rules-admission /)
Are there regulations for student progres-sion?		The Regulation "On the individual curriculum of a student at DSUM" (https://d-sum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Policy-pro-individual.university.plan.pdf) is developed in accordance with the Laws of Ukraine "On Education" and "On Higher Education", ECTS User's Guide 2015, "Regulations on the organization of educational process". The Individual Curriculum of a Student is a working document that contains information on: the list and sequence of the academic disciplines; the amount of student's educational load, taking into account all types of educational activities; assessment system (final semester control and graduate state certifica-tion). Individual plan is formed by the corresponding educational degree (bachelor, master) and is scheduled for each subsequent academic year in April of the current year (except for the first year study). The implementation of the individual curriculum is carried out in accordance with the schedule of classes, examination sessions, and individual curriculum, which is set by the dean's office. The individual responsibility for the implementation of the Individual Plan is done by the student.
Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?		At DSUM, the Regulations on the procedure and grounds for the issuance of diplomas about higher education obtained at Donetsk State University of Management (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Support-pro-order-manufacturing-procedure-and-grounds-for-issu-ance-diplomas-on-higher education-DSUM.pdf). An integral part of the Bachelor's, Specialist's, and Master's degrees is DIPLOMA SUPPLEMENT, which contains full information about the completed education. The appendix to the diploma consists of a list of disciplines studied with the evaluation marks, number of ECTS credits and competencies, and qualification obtained.

Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			The annual survey on students' opinion is held and regulated by the Regulation "On the system of quality assurance at DSUM". The survey is conducted by the sociological research laboratory of the university. The summarized survey data are published at conferences, and disseminated at the meetings of the Academic Council.

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?			Evaluation of the results of the Departments and individual staff members is carried out in accordance with the Regulations "On the ranking system of the evaluation of the teaching staff at DSUM".
Are there fair and transparent proce-dures for the recruitment of staff?			A system of staff provision at DSUM, which provides the formally defined transparent procedures for the selection, appointment and promotion of teaching staff in accordance with their professional competence.
Do the University support teachers development?			The DSUM teaching members are encouraged for academic mobility, study abroad; they have preferential opportunity to study at doctoral and postdoctoral programs.

ESG 1.6

Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?			As a result of displacement, due to the military conflict, DSUM has in its possession only 2 partially equipped study buildings. During the past 4 years, the university education resources and material base have been gradually restored (educational buildings, equipment, library fund, etc.). Local authorities provide definite support to the University. Part of the problem of material support is solved thanks to the international grants and sponsorship.
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?			A big part of DSUM students (about 1/4) today are the students from the occupied territories of Ukraine who have the status of internally displaced persons, therefore they need social support, and additional psychological help. Through the Institute of Curatorship, students are continuously provided with information and psychological support. Psychological support by teachers is a certain compensato-ry mechanism in regards to the various problems students face due to the underdeveloped infrastructure of the displaced university. The Institute of Curatorship now is planned to be gradually transformed into the Institute of Tutoring and the establishment of effective communication not only for the creation of a comfortable psychological atmosphere, but also for building a meaningfully effective trajectory for the training of each student. In this plan, links are established with the City Employment Center in Mariupol, where students can pass vocational guidance tests, receive psychologists advice on career develop-ment, record a video resume, etc.

ESG 1.7

Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?		The quality control of education is implemented through different procedures of internal audit. In particular, regarding the analysis of student learning outcomes, the procedure is as follows: in accordance with the rector's order, the dean's office prepares "Reports on the results of examinations and enrolments by students of full-time and part-time forms of study" for the semester and for the academic year, which contain a textual analysis of students' in comparison with the previous academic year, comparative tables, graphics etc. Reports are provided to the Department for Study Affairs, summarized and are posted on the university official website (https://dsum.edu.ua/documents/1518698681507-c9410ff6-7422 / Learning outcomes). In addition, the so called rector's control of students' knowledge is carried out as an additional monitoring of students' academic progress. (http://dsum.edu.ua/wp-content/up-loads/2015/11/Положення-про-організацію-та-проведення-ректорських-контроль них-робіт-у-ДонДУУ-16.pdf

ESG 1.8

Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?		The activities on the quality assurance of education are transparent. The website of the University (https://dsum.edu.ua/) regularly updates the information on these activities, in particular published criteria for the selection of studies (admission rules); qualifications that are provided; training, teaching and assessment procedures which are used, evaluation criteria and study opportunities available to students. Work is underway to improve the structuring of information and improve navigation on the University website, opening additional options for feedback from users.

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?		For each educational level and Specialty, the university standards are developed. The Major Departments on the basis of educational-professional (educational and scientific) program for each specialty develop a curriculum that defines the list and volume of academic disciplines in ECTS credits, the sequence of studying disciplines, forms of conducting training sessions and their volume, the schedule of the educational process, forms of current and final control. To specify the planning of the educational process for each academic year, a working curriculum is drawn up. The review of educational programs, the approval of curricula and syllabi of disciplines is carried out annually in the summer semester, approval is not later than in August, before the beginning of a new academic year.
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?		Every year at DSUM a poll is conducted among the students "Lecturer through student's eyes", in which they evaluate lecturers, can indicate suggestions on the content of study programs, the introduction of new elective courses, the use of new forms and teaching methods. Students can also make suggestions on how to improve their educational programs during conferences and presentations of elective courses. However, such are rare cases; in practice the vast majority of students in this respect remain passive.
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?		Moreover, representatives of student self-government are involved in the work of the Academic Council of the University; they may represent the opinion of the student community in the discussion and approval of educational programs. The plans of the University are the creation of expert sector councils for the development of educational programs in Specialties, 1/3 of which will be presented by students who are actively involved with the professional and successful graduates.

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?		Regarding external quality assurance, DSUM conducts licensing of specialties and accreditation of study programs within the framework of the current legislation of Ukraine every 5 years. By 2021 this procedure will be simplified in accordance with the Laws of Ukraine "On the displaced Higher Educational Institutions" and "On Support of Displaced Higher Educational Institutions".

3.2.8. Conclusions

After the displacement of DSUM to Mariupol, due to a military conflict, it was necessary to re-organize the material base, organizational relations, to seek new forms and methods of educational activities. The University has lost a significant part of the student and personnel contingent, but a renewal of the administrative staff has taken place, a young team aimed at innovation has started its activities. Foreign internships and experience in implementing international projects have enriched the administration and teaching members with new ideas on the European standards of quality education implementation. Increasing attention is paid to the University's individual approach to the student, student-centered learning. The normative basis for ensuring the education quality at the University has been updated (today there are 29 Regulations). The fourteen departments provide organizational, methodological, informational and technical support for training, conducting research, international relations, financial and economic, and accounting activities. The survey "Lecturer through student's eyes", has been re-established. In 2017, the work of the Education Quality Department was restored. Relationships with local business and government bodies are being established.

The system of internal quality assurance of educational activities, which is currently being developed at DSUM, provides for activities in the following areas:

— Focusing on student and user of education services.

— Constant development of the internal environment of higher education quality.

— Monitoring and periodic review of educational programs.

— An annual assessment of the applicants of higher education, scientific and pedagogical members of DSUM.

— Ensuring the availability of the necessary logistical, educational, methodological, and informational resources for the educational process organization.

In accordance with the EHEA standards on the internal quality assurance, DSUM cultivates academic integrity and freedom; prevents intolerance or discrimination against students or employees, taking into account the status of a displaced educational institution

(Regulations on Academic Integrity at Donetsk State University of Management). The Institute of Curator ensures that students are continuously provided with information and psychological support. The strength of links between education and research at DSUM is conducted through the research themes and their results implementation in the educational process.

After displacement to Mariupol, the teaching resources of DSUM have been gradually renewed (educational buildings, equipment, library fund, etc.). However, the issues of provision of students with dormitory, the development of sporting and leisure infrastructure have not been solved yet. Lack of state financing, as well as legislative restrictions on the implementation of the economic activities of the displaced universities, burden the process of DSUM development in Mariupol. It partially leads to the student outflow to other higher educational establishments. Residential difficulties experienced by displaced teaching members lead to staff outflow as well, which has its negative impact on ensuring the education quality.

Chapter 4.
National Metallurgical Academy Of Ukraine

3.4.1. Overview of the HEI

Main statistics:

— 7000 of students (3600 – full time)

— 240 International Students

— 600 teachers

— 320 of teachers with PhD degree

— 70 of teachers full professors

— NMAU in 2018 took total 15th place in the UNESCO TOP-200 ranking and 6th place among technical institutions of higher education

— In 2016, the certification unit of PLC «NPO International standards and systems» audited the quality assurance system of NMAU, the compliance with the requirements of DSTU ISO 9001:2009 (ISO 9001: 2009, IDT) of NMAU quality management system was

defined.

Directions of education

— Mechanical Engineering (18 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Electrical Engineering (5 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Automation (3 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Chemical Engineering (3 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Natural Sciences (1 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Management and Administration(11 B.Sc. And M.Sc. programs)

— Social and Behavior Sciences(2 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Humanitarian Sciences(1 B.Sc. and M.Sc. programs)

— Education and Pedagogy (1 B.Sc. and M.Sc. program)

International cooperation

International Projects: TEMPUS III

2014 Call for proposal:

— Curricular Reform of MSc&PhD Metallurgy Programmes "Inter-met" (2005-2008)

2016 Call for proposal:

— Career & Employability Centre: new service for graduates "CARE" (2007-2009)

International Projects: TEMPUS IV

Projects supported within the 2nd Call for proposal:

— Boosting the knowledge triangle by establishing Innovation Offices in Ukrainian higher education institutions, 2010-2013 www.uni4inno.eu

Projects supported within the 4th Call for proposal:

— Building capacity for University-Enterprise partnerships towards competency based training in Armenia, Georgia and Ukraine, 2011-2014,

www.cap4com.eu

Projects supported within the 5th Call for proposal:

— Modernizing higher engineering education in Georgia, Ukraine and Uzbekistan to meet the technology challenge, 2012-2015
www.engi-tec.net

— Support of innovations through improvement of regulatory framework for higher education in Ukraine, 2012-2015
www.spinoff-ua.eu

Projects supported within the 6th Call for proposal:

— Higher engineering training for environmentally sustainable industrial development, 2013-2016
www.hetes.com.ua

— Promoting Internationalization of HEIs in Eastern Neighborhood Countries through Cultural and Structural Adaptations, 2013-2016
www.picasa.ysu.am

— Centers of Excellence for Young Researchers, 2013-2016
www.ceres.ntu.edu.ua

International Projects: Erasmus+

Jean Monnet Module:

— European Union Leadership in Climate Change Mitigation, 2015-2018
www.euclim.com

KA2 – Capacity Building in Higher Education:

— Implementation of Education Quality Assurance system via cooperation of University-Business-Government in HEIs, 2017-2020
web.elth.ucv.ro/eduqas/

— Several Erasmus+ mobility projects with TU Bergakademie Freiberg, KU Leuven and University of Zagreb

Other International Projects:

— FP7 project Customise advisory services for energy efficient

manufacturing systems (2012-2016);

— Co-operation programme between Flanders and Central and Eastern Europe Flemish-Ukrainian Entrepreneurship Laboratory (2010-2012);

— DAAD (German Academic Exchange Service) Several grants under different subprogrammes within 2002-2018 in cooperation with Technische Universität „Bergakademie Freiberg" , Hannover University and University of Paderborn;

— Visby programme of Swedish Institute "Eurometallurg" project, 2002 – 2004;

— "New elite generation for Danieli company" Italy based Danieli company is the world leader in turn-key steelmaking projects. The project has started in 2005/ Adaptation of study programmes to demands of Danieli in cooperation with Politecnico di Milano. Danieli equipped Heavy Machinery Design Laboratory in the NMAU. NMAU students are employed in Dnipropetrovsk office of Danieli and abroad;

— Project "HAAS technology and education centre". In 2008 Haas company which is one of the world's leaders in numerically controlled machines has established HTEC at NMAU.

3.4.2. Presentation of the HEI QA system

The functioning of the internal quality assurance system for educational activities and the quality of higher education at NMAU is based on the principles of the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" and corresponds to the main objectives and tasks of the Statute and the Concept of Strategic Development of NMAU, it also takes into account the main indicators of international and national ratings (Webometrics, "TOP-200-Ukraine", etc.).

The QA system is a synergy of normative documents, procedures and university management structures which defines the mode of interaction among key stakeholders (both internal and external) and requirements to participants in the main processes reflecting the core activities of the Academy in relationship to education and research.

3.4.3. QA Structure

The backbone of the system relates to procedures and regulations indispensable for HEI to legally operate as a provider of educational services (copies of relevant documents – see above).

In addition to the above there are other procedures summarized in the regulatory documents that reflect the specifics of the activities of the relevant units responsible for QA at NMAU (approved by the Academic Council and the Orders of the Rector).

Moreover, to address practical needs and to determine development strategy the Concept of the development of university towards 2025 has been developed in 2018 (subsequent to previous document covering period from 2015 to 2019), which defines the main goals, principles of implementation and directions of work, allows coordinating and concentrating efforts and resources in order to maintain National status according to current requirements, determined by MESU. This Concept is based on the most valuable assets of the world society, human values and principles of humanism, democracy, inheritance of academic legacy and continuity, orientation towards personality, openness and accessibility, conformity to the requirements of the present and future, continuous improvement and ability to change, innovation, creative activity and others.

The main structural units implementing the quality assurance system at NMAU are:

— Rectorate;

— Academy Council;

— Supervisory Board;

— Council for Quality Assurance of Educational Activities and Training;

— Educational and Research Center;

— Educational Office;

— Scientific and Methodological Commissions for each Study Program;

— Offices of Deans at each Faculty;

— Chairs.

3.4.4. QA Mechanisms

The main coordinating body for the planning, management and quality control of the educational process and is the Rectorate, which includes the Rector, Vice Rectors, deans of faculties, representatives of student self-government bodies.

The Educational and Research Center carries out collection and analysis of information on the activity of the NMAU subdivisions, the development of NMAU regulatory materials and proposals for improving the educational process. It is also responsible for control of the quality of teaching, including assessment of documentation as well as attendance of classes and check of the quality of knowledge.

The Educational Office is mostly engaged with routine issues of the organization of the educational process, including - the coordination of the workload, the schedule of classes, examinations, documentation etc.

The implementation of the educational process is carried out by departments and Dean's Offices of the faculties.

One of the main features of internal quality assurance system is an extensive multi-level system for monitoring the quality of students' knowledge: current control, modular (for each module) and semester (final). Such a system allows provide feedback between the teacher and the student and also due to repeated repetition of the material promotes a better quality of assimilation

NMAU policy of quality assurance is implemented through appropriate measures and a wide range of internal procedures at all levels of the academy.

There are following main measures and procedures:

1. Implementation of the concept of «student-centered» learning;

2. Application of efficient mechanisms for the development, approval, monitoring and periodic review of educational programs;

3. Assessment of students;

4. Assessment and upgrade of qualification of research and teaching staff;

5. Assessment of availability of the necessary resources for the performing of the educational process;

6. Application of the system of preventing and detecting the academic plagiarism in scientific works of employees and students;

7. Application of information systems for management of educational process;

8. Application of the clear and transparent procedures for admission to study, recognition of learning outcomes and acquired qualifications;

9. Innovative development of scientific research, integrated combination of education, science and innovations;

10. Ensuring the process of education and self-development of creative personality;

11. Implementation of the continuous analysis of the quality of educational activities through ratings and both internal and external audits.

Each procedure has description and guidelines.

3.1.5. QA Strategy

QA Strategy of NMAU consists of several documents:

1. The Concept of the development of university towards 2025 has been developed in 2018 (subsequent to previous document covering period from 2015 to 2019), which defines the main goals, principles of implementation and directions of work, allows coordinating and concentrating efforts and resources in order to maintain National status according to current requirements, determined by MESU. This Concept is based on the most valuable assets of the world society, human values and principles of humanism, democracy, inheritance of academic legacy and continuity, orientation towards personality, openness and accessibility, conformity to the requirements of the present and future, continuous improvement and ability to change, innovation, creative activity and others.

2. Regulations which describe 11 main procedures (described in part 2 of this question). The main regulations are: Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU; Council Regulation on quality assurance of educational activities and training of

specialists in NMAU; Regulations on educational and methodical commissions NMAU; Methodology for developing educational programs; Regulations on the procedure for conducting competitive selection and drawing up of labor contracts (contracts) with research and educational workers NMAU; Regulations on Council for Quality Assurance for Education and Training; Regulations on the educational and scientific center of NMAU; Typical regulation about NMAU faculty; Typical regulation about NMAU department; Regulations about student self-government at NMAU; Regulations about Academic Mobility of Students of NMAU; Regulations on the rating system for assessing the achievements of NMAU students; Regulations on examination commissions of NMAU; Organization of the development and defense of diploma projects at NMAU; Regulations on determining the rating of structural subdivisions, scientific and pedagogical workers, scientific staff, graduate students and doctoral students of NMAU; Regulations on the payment of monetary compensation to pedagogical workers for a diligent work, exemplary performance of official duties; Regulations on the Career and Employment Support Center of NMAU.

Stakeholders

There are several approaches to engage the internal and external stakeholders:

1. Supervisory board includes representatives from leading industries , business and regional authorities;

2. Scientific and methodological commissions (responsible for the development and implementation of study programs) include representatives of students and leading experts from industrial enterprises or business. This allows provide communication between university and external stakeholders, and internal communication between university and students.

3. Expert evaluation of the relevance of educational programs by the representatives of the labor market. This measures are organized by Career and Employment Support Center in the following ways:

— Collection of feedbacks from enterprises, institutions and organizations (employers);

— Analysis of the demands of labor market;

— Conduction of the questionnaires of graduates to assess the quality of educational process, the relevance of the content of training to the real needs of jobs. The Center of Career and Employment Support Center was established within the implementation of the TEMPUS project UM_JEP-27010_2006 "Career & Employability Centre New service for graduates" and delivers the synergy between previous EU-funded projects and EDUQAS.

4. Youth Information Center (YIC) contributes to the innovative research activities of young scientists, Ph.D. students, M.Sc. and B.Sc. students, more active cooperation with industrial partners. The YIC was created within the framework of another EU-funded TEMPUS project CERES (Centers of Excellence for young RESearchers, reg. no. 544137-TEMPUS-1-2013-1-SK-TEMPUS-JPHES.

5. Students' self-government. Students are the members of the Academic Council, Faculty Councils, Scientific and Methodological Councils and actively involved in the certification of teaching staff and in the appointment of scholarships.

3.1.6. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
ESG 1.1			
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality	✓		See full description in Ch.2 above
Does the institution promote quality culture?	✓		See full description in Ch.2 above

73

If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?		See full description in Ch.2 above
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?		See full description in Ch.2 above

ESG 1.2

Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?		Council Regulation on quality assurance of educational activities and training of specialists in NMAU - Academic Council, protocol No. 2 dated 25.02.2016 Regulations on educational and methodical commissions NMAU - Academic Council, protocol No. 2 dated 25.02.2016
Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?		Methodology for developing educational programs - Academic Council, protocol No. 3 dated 27.03.2017 Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU - Academic Council, protocol No. 8 dated 03.09.2015
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?		Regulations on educational and methodical commissions NMAU - Academic Council, protocol No. 2 dated 25.02.2016

ESG 1.3

Question			References
Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?			Regulations on the procedure for conducting competitive selection and drawing up of labor contracts (contracts) with research and educational workers NMAU - Academic council, protocol № 9 dated 04.12.2017 Regulations on Council for Quality Assurance for Education and Training - Academic council, protocol № 2 dated 25.02.2016 Regulations on the educational and scientific center of NMAU - Academic council, protocol № 2 dated 22.02.2011 Typical regulation about NMAU department - Academic council, protocol № 12 dated 28.11.2016
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?			Regulations about student self-government at NMAU - Students conference 15/12/2016 Regulations about the organization of educational process in NMAU (section 3) - Academic Council, protocol No.8 dated 03/09/2015 Regulations about Academic Mobility of Students of NMAU - Order of the Rector No.74 dated 04/07/2013 Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU (sections 2.1 and 4.2) - Academic Council, protocol No.8 dated 03/09/2015
Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?			Regulations about Academic Mobility of Students of NMAU - Order of the Rector No.74 dated 04/07/2013 Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU (sections 2.1 and 4.2) - Academic Council, protocol No.8 dated 03/09/2015
The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance			
Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;			Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU (sections 5.2-5.8) - Academic Council, protocol No.8 dated 03/09/2015
Is there a procedure for students appeals?			

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admission?			Students are admitted in accordance with Ukrainian Law of education, regulations of Ministry and education of sciences of Ukraine. Student admission rules are posted on the NMAU website.
Are there regulations for student progression?			Regulations on the organization of educational process in NMAU (sections 5.2-5.8) - Academic Council, protocol No.8 dated 03/09/2015 Regulations on the rating system for assessing the achievements of NMAU students - Academic council, protocol № 9 dated 04.12.2017 Regulations on examination commissions NMAU - Academic council, protocol № 1 dated 26.01.2015 Organization of performance of qualifying works at NMAU - Academic council, protocol № 2 dated 25.02.2016
Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?			Students receive an international degree diploma. The structure of the document was developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine in accordance with the recommendations of the UN, the European Commission, the Council of Europe, UNESCO. Information is given in Ukrainian and English. Diploma consists of 2 parts – Diploma and Transcript of Records in both Ukrainian and English.
Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			Assessment of the level of pedagogical skill of teachers by students is carried out by means of a questionnaire organized by the educational and scientific center in accordance with the approved plan or during the competitive selection procedure. Development of the form of the questionnaire, processing of the questionnaire of the results and preparation of the relevant materials for consideration by the competition committee NMAU or Academic Council of the academy, faculties (institutes) is carried out by the educational and scientific centre. The results are discussed at the meetings of the Council for Quality Assurance for Education and Training Regulations on the procedure for conducting competitive selection and drawing up of labor contracts (contracts) with research and educational workers NMAU - Academic council, protocol № 9 dated 04.12.2017.

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?			
Are there fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment of staff?			
Do the University support teachers development?			rotocol № 9 dated 27.09.2010.

ESG 1.6

Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?		NMAU has regular funding of educational and scientific activities from the government. Also important sources of funding are extra-budgetary sources: training of contract students, the implementation of scientific work in enterprises, the commercialization of scientific research.
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?		43% of students according to the rating system for assessing the students' achievements have scholarships (Regulations on the rating system for assessing the achievements of NMAU students, Regulations on the scholarship of persons studying in NMAU). Students also receive social scholarships. If necessary, students also receive material assistance from the profession union.

ESG 1.7

Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?		For collect analyses and use relevant information the Information and analytical management system and Electronic document management system were created. Educational and methodological centre analyses the information and offers recommendations to academy management

ESG 1.8

Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?		This item is provided by Regulations about common informational environment NMAU

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?		
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?		Generalization and operational response to problem situations regarding the content of educational programs Carries out the Educational and Scientific Center and Scientific and methodological commission. Scientific and methodological commission includes students. The main regulations are - Regulations on scientific and methodological commission (Academic Council, protocol No.2 dated 25/02/2016) and Regulations on the educational and scientific center of NMAU (Academic Council, protocol No. 2 dated 22.02.2011)
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?		

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?		Expert evaluation of the relevance of educational programs by the representatives of the labor market organizes a Career support and employment support center by: - introduction of feedback from enterprises, institutions and organizations (employers); - analysis of supply and demand in the labor market - conducting questionnaires for higher education graduates and graduates to assess the relevance of the content of training and the level of educational process organization by: - introduction of feedback from enterprises, institutions and organizations (employers); - analysis of supply and demand in the labor market - conducting questionnaires for higher education graduates and graduates to assess the relevance of the content of training and the level of educational process organization The activity is carried out according to Regulations on the Career and Employment Support Center of NMAU - Academic Council, protocol №. 9 dated 27.09.2010 External audit is an assessment of the effectiveness of the Academy's activities by an external Agency in order to adjust development plans and overcome weaknesses of activities. In 2016, the certification body of PLC «NPO International standards and systems» audited the quality assurance system of NMAU, the compliance with the requirements of DSTU ISO 9001:2009 (ISO 9001: 2009, IDT) of NMAU quality management system was defined.

3.4.7. Conclusions

From the analysis above following conclusions can be drawn:

1. Existing internal quality assurance system in NMAU fully complies with the ESG;

2. The internal quality assurance system covers all structural units of the university and different stages of educational process;

3. The existing system of procedures, their description and regulations allow to provide «holistic approach» to ensure the internal quality system of educational process;

4. One of the main features of internal quality assurance system is an extensive multi-level system for monitoring the quality of students' knowledge: current control, modular (for each module) and semester (final). Such a system allows provide the feedback between the teacher and the student and also, due to repeated repetitions of the learnt materials, promotes a better quality of assimilation.

Improvement of QA planned at NMAU in the frames of EDUQAS

1. The following disadvantages were identified during the analysis of the quality assurance system:

— The functions of quality control in various activity fields in NMAU are distributed among several units; There is no unit that

carries out a comprehensive analysis of the effectiveness of the internal quality assurance system, identifies "bottlenecks" and formulates problems for improving the situation;

— The activities of different units involved in quality assurance require better coordination and coherence.

2. It was decided to change the internal quality assurance system (IQAS) at NMAU according to the experience and practices of Bulgarian, Romanian and Swedish universities learnt by NMAU staff during the study visits in frames of EDUQAS project.

— The main feature of the modernized structure is the establishing of two new units: Commission of the Academic Council for Monitoring the Quality of Educational Activities and the Sector for Quality of Educational Activities operating within the Educational and Scientific Center.

— These new units have the following tasks:

Commission of Academic Council for Monitoring the Quality of Educational Activities - monitoring of IQAS, preparation of the annual report, formulation of tasks for the IQAS improvement;

Sector for Quality of Educational Activities – technical support of the activities of Commission of Academic Council for Monitoring the Quality of Educational Activities and the Council for Quality Assurance of Education and Training, implementation of the IQAS measures and procedures, collection and processing of statistical data, questionnaire research, etc.

Chapter 5.
Kazakh Ablai khan University of International Relations and World Languages

3.5.1. Overview of the HEI

17 education Bachelor's programs, 14 Master's programs and 4 PhD programs:

— Faculty of translation and philology (foreign philology, translation studies);

— Pedagogical faculty of foreign languages (foreign language teaching);

— Faculty of management and international communication (journalism, communications, hospitality, tourism,);

— Faculty of international relations (international relation, regional (area) studies);

— Faculty of economy and law (economics, management, marketing, law);

— Faculty of oriental studies (oriental studies);

— Faculty of graduate studies (all Master's and PhD programs).

For 2018-2019 academic year:

— 801+ at QS World University Ranking;

— 147th at QS EECA;

— 9th at National Ranking of HEIs by Independent agency for accreditation and rating;

— 7200 students and 251 international students;

— 470 academic staff and 14 international academic staff;

— 132 foreign partner HEIs;

— member of 14 prestigious organizations;

— providing teaching in 14 world languages;

3.5.2. Presentation of the HEI QA system

In "Ablai Khan University", the organization and coordination of work in the field of quality management system is concerned with the department of strategy, development and monitoring, which has the special position of a specialist with knowledge of management, including quality, who works to organize and coordinate the activities of the university in accordance with ISO international standards for quality management system.

3.5.3. QA Structure

The scope of the QMS applies to educational sphere in training personnel with higher professional education (bachelor, specialist) in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, state educational standards of higher professional education in specialties and areas in accordance with the scope of licensing and state accreditation and internal regulatory documents.

3.5.4. QA Mechanisms

The university's quality system is aimed at ensuring the quality assurance of the results of educational, research, educational, social and other types of university activities.

Each of the types (subtypes) of activity has certain indicators of effectiveness and efficiency.

The activity of the university as a whole is estimated through the balanced scorecard system, and the activity of the faculty through the system of efficiency factors.

During the **staff recruiting,** realizing that the main asset of the university is the university workers, the competence of the faculty is checked in accordance with the labor legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulatory documents, as well as individual interviews in the HR Department and with heads of structural divisions.

In order **to improve the staff competence**, staff development is carried out according to annual plans: department work plans, schedule of refresher courses, individual plans for teachers, undergraduates, graduate students, applicants, and, accordingly, tracking the results of plans.

After completing advanced training courses, teachers report on the department meetings. Following the discussion of the report, the effectiveness of training is assessed.

Regular attestation of employees allows for the proper time assessment of staff in order to further motivate them, review career development plans and more efficiently use the work of teaching staff.

In order to clearly organize the educational process and determine the resources, the university plans and determines the academic load, the required resources of the faculty, determines and monitors the implementation of plans for students' educational and research work, etc., in accordance with established criteria.

To organize a **high-quality educational process**, an analysis of methodological developments is carried out at meetings of the department, the methodological council of the faculty and the Scientific and Methodological Council of the University, open lectures, and mutual visits of managers and staff of their colleagues' divisions are conducted. The results of the analysis are recorded in the minutes of the department meetings, the methodological council of the faculty and the Scientific and Methodological Council of the University. Based on an extract from the relevant protocol, the methodological development is replicated and their use is permitted.

Similar processes of control, with the establishment of clear objectives, deadlines, forms of implementation of tasks or other criteria are established for other processes - research, educational, social, etc.

Through **questioning students, faculty members**, tracking information flows of Internet resources, printing, collecting information about employment from students and employer feedback, information is collected as feedback from consumers and their satisfaction with the services provided for further analysis at the academic council and taking action improvement activities.

The **results and evaluation** of the ratings obtained, the External Evaluation of Learning Achievements., reports of internal auditors, conclusions on individual issues by working groups, as well as other indicators, are the basis for conducting in-depth analysis from the management in order to further apply and improve educational activities.

3.5.5. QA Strategy

The University's website for external users as well as for the internal consumers has posted the Abylai Khan University Mission and strategic vision. In the "Internal regulatory documents" only for the staff of the university is the university's strategy, quality policy,

and also the goals of the university.

At the same time, the quality policy of the Kazakh University of International Relations and World Languages named after Abylai Khan was developed and maintained to meet the intentions and development programs of the University, state programs, and also includes QMS commitments, creates the basis for analyzing and defining the Goals of the University .

On an annual basis, the Objectives of the Kazakh University of International Relations and World Languages named after Abylai Khan are developed in the field of quality, including those that are necessary to fulfill the requirements for educational services in all services, departments, deans of the university.

4) Stakeholders

To fully take into account the interests of all stakeholders, a system has been created at the university, suggesting that stakeholders can influence the activities of the university from the stage of strategic planning to the monitoring and evaluation of educational and scientific innovation processes.

To do this, it is carried out to:

— **Monitoring, fixing, evaluating stakeholder positions and taking necessary measures.**

So, the collection of feedback from applicants, students and other segments of the population entering the information networks is regularly held. Information is analyzed and. if necessary, measures are taken.

When conducting a survey of faculty and students on their satisfaction with the activities of the university, they are also analyzed.

Analysis of individual situations is carried out at the Academic Council, in the Rector's Office, when conducting training for employees, developing internal regulatory documents and improving processes.

— **Information and education of stakeholders (distribution of information materials, public presentations, presentations at "round tables", conferences).**

For this purpose, an Image policy has been developed, an

action plan has been drawn up for its implementation. For 2017-2018, 51 articles were published in the public media, website, social networks. Eleven television appearances took place. More than ten different round tables were held, and university staff took an active part in scientific conferences.

— Counseling and consideration of the positions and interests of stakeholders during the planning of the university activities.

The University Academic Council developed and approved a university development strategy for 2017-2018. The development of the Strategy took into account the views of all stakeholders, the requirements of the legislation, the Ministry of Education, shareholders, the current state of the educational market and the needs of the future.

3.5.6. Internal QA documents

The university has developed internal regulatory documents regulating and coordinating the activities of various processes. To increase the availability of Internal regulatory document, all university staff, their safety, the use of current internal documents at the university introduced an electronic database of "Internal documents".

The University has the following QMS processes:

Document management:

— Document management (Documents management 01-2016);

— Procedure for the development and execution of documents (Special technical conditions 01-2016);

— Management of organizational documentation (Special technical conditions 02-2016);

— Management of official documents (Special technical conditions 03-2016);

— Archive management (Special technical conditions 03-2016);

— Management of note-taking documents (Documents management 02-2016).

Management responsibility:

—Planning improvements of University (Special technical conditions 04-2016);

— Analysis of QMS from the University management (Special technical conditions 04-2016).

— System of balanced scorecard (Rules management 01-2018)

Resource provision:

— Regulations on organizational structure of the University (Quality assurance plan 02-2018)

— Staff management (Special technical conditions 05-2016);

— Qualification upgrade (Special technical conditions 05-2016);

— Performance evaluation by key performance indicators (Quality assurance plan 03-2018)

— Certification of faculty, staff and managers (Special technical conditions 22-2016)

— Management of financial-economic spheres (Special technical conditions 06-2016)

— Production management (Special technical conditions 08-2016);

— Infrastructure management (Special technical conditions 08-2016);

— Operation, maintenance and repair of equipment (Special technical conditions 08-2016);

— Educational work and social conditions for students (Special technical conditions 14-2016).

Life cycle:

— Design and development of educational services (Special technical conditions 09-2016);

— Management of the selection process of the applicants (Special technical conditions 10-2016);

— Study process planning (Special technical conditions 11-2016);

— Study process management (Special technical conditions 12-2016);

— Management of educational and methodologic work (Special technical conditions 13-2016);

— Process of planning of Teaching and Methodologic complex on discipline Special technical conditions 17-2016);

— Information resources management (Special technical conditions 07-2016);

— Management of graduates' distribution process (Special technical conditions 15-2016);

— Management of student research processes (Special technical conditions 19-2016)

— Process management research (Special technical conditions 20-2016)

— Organization of the distance education (Special technical conditions 21-2016)

— Image policy (ПК 01-2018);

— Control, monitoring and analysis of consumer appeals (Special technical conditions 01-2018)

— Work order with corporate web-sites (Special technical conditions 02-2018)

About the improvement:

— Control on quality of the study process (Quality management 01-2016);

— Knowledge evaluation (Special technical conditions 16-2016);

— Liquidation of the academic debts (Special technical conditions 16-2016);

— Conduction of the internal audits (Documents management 03-2016);

— Management of nonconforming products (Documents management 04-2016);

— Corrective actions (Documents management 05-2016);

— Preventive actions (Documents management 06-2016).

The sequence and interaction of the processes are defined in this Quality Manual through their schematic description.

To support process performance:

— In the internal documents of the QMS, the methods and criteria necessary for achieving the effectiveness of the processes were developed;

— QMS processes are provided with the necessary resources and information.

3.5.7. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
ESG 1.1			
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality	✓		Possibly the most important instrument is the main KAUIR*WL QA document, the "Guide for quality" which adopted on February 22, 2016, and which sets out the quality assurance activities at each level across the university. It outlines the quality system in place to verify that student learning outcomes are achieved, and to determine how programmes should be improved.
Does the institution promote quality culture?	✓		Quality culture could be explored on visible formal aspects of this culture including processes for programme development and approval, a strong focus on student learning and the student experience, and many other relevant examples. KAUIR&WL staff at all levels has well-awareness of the importance of quality culture and the need to enhance this.
If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?	✓		Key principles of quality assurance is made on "Development strategy for 2017-2020" of KAUIR&WL, which can be found on homepage of HEI. http://www.ablaikhan.kz/en/
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?	✓		Development strategy and monitoring Office, as well as faculties contribute to internal KAUIR*WL quality assurance processes and prepare information on risks for further improvement of institutional and study programmes quality.

ESG 1.2

Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?		KAUIR*WL has processes for the design and approval of its programmes. The programmes designing so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme has to clearly specified and communicated, and have to refer to the correct level of the National Qualifications Framework of Higher Education.
Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?		The KAUIR*WL head of Study-methodic Office is responsible for the organisation of teaching, and also for monitoring the quality of teaching, for all programmes within that department or unit. Individual academic staff are in charge of their own teaching, as long as they stay within the framework of the programme as agreed with Academic Office. Each subject has a Syllabus which includes details of the programme and the expected learning outcomes. Lectures, seminars and tutorials all have assigned outcomes and how these will be assessed. As previously noted, programmes can be adapted and changed through an agreed process at local programme level and then at faculty level.
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?		Stakeholders also expressed strong support for greater collaboration between different disciplines in programme design and approval, including the opportunity for students to take more electives. Electivity of courses would allow students to develop a broader range of career options, some more technical or narrow, others broader and more general.

ESG 1.3

Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?		Generally academic staff activity is assessed through KPI system, which covers quality of teaching, pedagogical methods, as well as way of delivery of knowledge, adequacy of materials, etc. In terms of the assessment of academic staff by students, the results of this are available to the relevant head of department, as well as to the dean and vice-deans for education at the faculty. Part-time external specialist teaching staff are also covered by this survey, and the results are important in terms of renewing contracts.
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?		There are a number of advanced teaching methods at the university: key-study, peer-review assessment, brainstorm, work in small groups (opponent, reviewer, lecturer and etc.)
Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?		There are standards of quality assurance and approval processes to support the delivery of flexible learning programmes in terms of pace (accelerated learning programmes) and place (distance learning/online learning programmes), which are mentioned at KAUIR&WL strategy of development for 2016-2019. The development process for these programmes can therefore be relatively straightforward. There few flexible learning modes at the KAUIR&WL.
The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance		Learning achievements of students are scored on a 100-point scale corresponding to the internationally accepted letter system (positive grades, descending, from "A" to "D", "unsatisfactory" - "F") with the corresponding digital equivalent of 4 point scale. The tutor conducts all types of current and midterm control and displays an appropriate assessment of the current progress of students. The Office of the Registrar of the University maintains a history of students' educational achievements during the entire periods of study, which is reflected in the transcript. At the end of the school year, the Registrar's office calculates the GPA as a weighted average of the student's level of academic achievement. There is a main academic informing tool - online learning portal. All criteria and assessment for marking are published on this portal.

Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;			Main principle of KAUIR&WL students assessment is clear and consistent processes for the setting, marking, grading and moderation of assignments, are reflected on "Guide for quality".
Is there a procedure for students appeals?			The University makes information about complaints and appeals available to students directly through tutors. The University seeks to resolve complaints in a timely and informal way, directing students to raise the issue first, where appropriate, with their tutor, department or member of academic staff. - Students can direct non-academic complaints to the facility or service in question and academic complaints to faculty and department. - At the formal complaints stage students complete a complaint form, which directs them to sources of support. Upon receipt of formal complaints a head, or dean, of the relevant department arranges interviews with the parties concerned and consults evidence before writing a report for the administration. The University intends to resolve complaints within 15 working days, and if students remain dissatisfied, they may request a review by a Rector. - Some departments offer students the opportunity to make an informal appeal to the department prior to launching a formal appeal through the University's procedures. The University has adequate policies that underpin the complaints and appeals procedures, and effective systems in place for making students aware of the routes for resolution available to them, and for monitoring the effectiveness of such procedures.

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admission?			KAUIR&WL has consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student 'life-cycle', including enrolment (admission), registration, progression, recognition and certification.
Are there regulations for student progression?			Student progression is basic principle of educational programme development at KAUIR&WL.
Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?			Persons who have completed training in an educational program of higher education and have passed the final certification are awarded an academic degree "bachelor", "master" or "PhD" and are issued a state diploma with a transcript in the Kazakh, Russian and English languages. Information about the program of study (code of discipline), name of the discipline, duration of study of the discipline (year, semester, trimester), grade for training (in the national scale and in the ECTS scale), the number of awarded ECTS credits are entered into the transcript about training.
Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			A significant number of surveys are undertaken by KAUIR&WL each year as part of the overall quality process. These cover the assessment of teachers, the assessment of courses, the assessment of administrative staff, and the assessment of faculty authorities. Decisions regarding which surveys mentioned bellow are used and when are taken by the faculty deans, as well as the choice and use of follow-up quality enhancement measures.

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?		In its discussions regarding the KAUIR&WL teaching and learning mission and strategy, academic performance has therefore traditionally been evaluated mostly in terms of research. In more recent years this traditional perception of an academic career has broadened somewhat to also include cooperating with industry. However, there is a contradiction between this traditional approach and the system for paying academics, where salaries are linked directly to the number of teaching hours.
Are there fair and transparent proce-dures for the recruitment of staff?		There is an advertisement for every vacant job position for academic staff; there is list of requirements for this position competition.
Do the University support teachers development?		There are number of opportunities for teachers: internships, capacity building, visiting professors lectures, international academic mobility. When faculties had to reduce the numbers of academic staff, the quality of teaching was one of the criteria taken into account. In situations where the student assessment of academic staff is not positive, then the teacher is asked to comment on why the assessment is poor; if in the second semester this has not changed, then the teacher is removed. Students themselves however express a concern that their assessment of academic staff was not always treated anonymously, leading to reluctance among students to provide feedback.

ESG 1.6

Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?		Formal training courses play a part in this, academic staff have traditionally used opportunities such as staff mobility, including incoming visiting academics, to observe and learn from teaching methodologies, good practice and ideas in other universities, and to gain experience from working in different environments. KAUIR&WL had recently successfully obtained a few grants from the Ministry to improve didactic methods across the entire teaching body, not just for teachers with identified needs. Also university has ongoing 5 projects on Erasmus+ ICM, which also available for teaching staff. A broad range of staff development topics are now being put in place, such as the use of multi-media in a classroom context. The deans have been asked to nominate people to attend these courses, but they are also open to all interested staff members. Staff in administrative units are able to participate in various international staff development opportunities and exchanges with other universities. Staff can also participate in language learning courses.
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?		There number of tuition grants for students.

ESG 1.7

Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?		Through the range of instruments used, KAUIR*WL collects considerable amounts of quality-related data on a regular basis. Analysis and use is made of this data, either for the purposes of feedback to staff and students, or for input to the central university decision-making processes.

ESG 1.8

Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?		All information could be found on official homepage of University through the link. http://www.ablaikhan.kz/en/

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?		Annual surveys cover the assessment of teachers, the assessment of courses, the assessment of administrative staff, and the assessment of faculty authorities.
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?		Decisions regarding which surveys mentioned bellow are used and when are taken by the faculty deans, as well as the choice and use of follow-up quality enhancement measures.
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?		A significant number of surveys are undertaken by KAUIR&WL each year as part of the overall quality process. These cover the assessment of teachers, the assessment of courses, the assessment of administrative staff, and the assessment of faculty authorities.

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?		Our University is accredited by International and National Accreditation Agencies (study programmes and institutional). We get accreditation every 4 or 5 years.

3.1.8. Conclusions

The KAUIR&WL has a high percentage of graduate's employability and trains competitive graduates.

The KAUIR&WL is working towards providing the high quality student centered learning and the adaptation of study programs and teaching methods to expectations of labor market.

The focus of the University in terms of QA on the creating of conditions to promote the education quality, and on an objective assessment of the professional competencies of students and graduates. Today, the issues of the quality of higher education are relevant for Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan needs highly qualified specialists who are proper to a market needs.

Kazakhstan has a well-developed National Quality management system; has joined the Bologna Process in 2010; is developing quality assurance system reform.

However, it is necessary to develop, update and improve internal quality control standards with taking into account needs of the employers. The focus of the QA policy of our University is enhancing employability of our students and to develop Quality Culture.

Chapter 6.
Kazakh University Of Economy, Finance And International Trade

3.6.1. Overview of the HEI

In accordance with the State license, the University provides programs in the following Bachelor, Master and PhD degree specialties:

Bachelor
5B050600 - Economics
5B050700 - Management
5B090500 – Social work
5B050900 - Finance
5B030400 – Customs

5B070300 – Information Systems

5B050800 – Accounting and Auditing

5B051100 - Marketing

5B051000 – State and Local Administration

5B090200 - Tourism

5B051300 – World Economy

5B090800– Evaluation

5B042100 - Design

5B010300 – Pedagogic and Psychology

Master
6M050800 – Accounting and Auditing
6M050900 - Finance
6M051000 - State and Local Administration
6M050700 - Management
6M050600 - Economics

6M070300 - Information Systems
6M090500 – Social work

PhD
6D050600 - Economics
6D050700 – Management

There are 4 faculties - "Economics and Business", "Basic Education", "Applied Sciences", "Distance Learning".

The University also has an International Business School (IBS) that implements professional MBA and DBA programs.

The educational process is provided by 10 Departments, including 8 main and 2 additional departments ("General education disciplines", "Kazakh and foreign languages").

Education in all specialties of the University is carried out on credit technology in two languages - Kazakh and Russian, as well as in the mode of experiment in English - in the specialty "World Economy".

Continuing the policy to improve the quality of education, the University annually participates in the ranking of educational programs at the national and regional levels.

In 2018, according to the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA), the National ranking of the best humanitarian and economic universities of Kazakhstan - 2018 - KazUEFIT took the 5th place.

58 universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan took part in the ranking of the IAAR. In the institutional (general) ranking of universities in the section of preparing specialists in "Economics and Business" KazUEFIT took the 5th place, "Services" — the 9th place

among the universities of Kazakhstan and entered the top-10.

In the ranking of universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan in educational programs on the levels and areas of training under the undergraduate programs KazUEFIT took on specilaty:

— 5B030400 – Customs - 2nd place;
— 5B090500 – Social work - 2nd place;
— 5B070300 – Information systems - 3rd place
— 5B051100 – Marketing - 3rd place;

according to Master programs:
— 6M050700 – Management - 1st place;
— 6M050900 – Finance – 3rd place;
— 6M050600 – Economics - 4th place;

6 educational programs: 5B050600, 6M050600 "Economics", 5B050700, 6M050700 "Management", 5B050900, 6M050900 "Finance" accredited by FIBAA Committee for 5 years from September 2017 to the end of the 2022 summer semester.

Today KazUEFIT is one of the leading economic universities in Kazakhstan. The staff number is 115 people, 54.5% among them are academic staff with scientific degrees and titles.

The international activity in KazUEFIT is carried out within the framework of the cooperation agreements with foreign (57) universities and organizations, including 29 with partners from far abroad and 28 with partners from near abroad (CIS countries). As part of these agreements, meetings, round tables, conferences, guest lectures and other events are held.

There are 2 structural Erasmus+ projects:

1. "Towards Incoming International University communities" (WELCOME) 573655-EPP-1-2016-1-EC-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP.
2. Implementation of Education Quality Assurance System via Cooperation of University - Business-Government in HEIs" (EDUQAS) 586109-EPP-1-2017-1-RO-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP.

Also KazUEFIT a part of Erasmus+ International Credit Mobility program KA107-36589 project coordinated by University of Valladolid.

According to a student-centered approach, the University provides high-quality and affordable education to all students with equal opportunities.

— The University provides 3-level training: BA, MA, BBA, MBA, PhD, DBA;
— The University has a Faculty of Distance Learning;
— Double-degree program with the University of Kangnam University (South Korea);
— Academic mobility programs;
— The Evaluation Funds (Regulation on the student's learning evaluation system on the development of a modular educational program)
— The University has privileges for a certain group of students (Regulation on educational benefits for students in KazUEFIT);
— The Commission of Inquiry;
— and other.

3.6.2. Presentation of the HEI QA system

In January 2013 "Quality Control Department" was opened at the Univeristy. Department concludes a Head of the Department and a Leading specialist.

Processes:

— Organizational work on the University's institutional accreditation process, specialized accreditation process, inspection audit for compliance of the quality management system with the requirements of National Standard ISO 9001-2016.

— Internal audits at the university

— Preparing surveys for students, teachers, employers

— Development of internal regulations.

— Organization of work of the University Coordination Council

3.6.3. QA Structure

Functions of the Quality Control Department:

— Maintenance and improvement of the quality management system (QMS) of KazUEFIT (development, approval of documented QMS procedures, regulations, rules, instructions of the University)

— Information and methodological support of the accreditation of the university and separate educational programs.

— Realization of a complex of measures on internal audit, quality monitoring and ensuring the possibility of the qualified use of their results for making managerial decisions.

— The organization and conduct of monitoring studies of the satisfaction of stakeholders with the quality of education at the university, the study of their requirements and needs.

3.6.4. QA Mechanisms

The University has a Scientific Council, Coordination Council, Scientific and Methodological Council.

More than 20 commissions, the majority includes students.

3.6.5. QA Strategy

The implementation of the main activities of KazUEFIT is carried out in accordance with the Strategy of the university. The KazUEFIT strategic plan for 2016-2020 was developed as part of the implementation of the State Program and the Concept for the Development of Education in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The plan was approved by the Academic Council on October 22nd, 2015, Protocol No. 3.

"The strategy for development of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade - 2020" is posted on the university's internal resource - in the repository of the ARTA system.

The university follows 4 strategic directions of activity:
1. Preparing competitive and qualified specialists.
2. Positioning the university as a research and development centre.
3. Development of human resources and management system.
4. Development of infrastructure and material and technical base

of the university.

Stakeholders (all internal actors – students, administrative and researches are engaged in QA as well as external stakeholders, in which areas);

In order to improve the mechanisms of internal quality assessment and examination of educational programs, the Academic Councils of educational programs for all majors, which included leading university professors, employers and students.

Module Educational programs expertise on all majors is carried out by employers. Employer's reviews are given to the Educational-methodical complexes of modules for the BA, MA and PhD studies.

The University has a Department for Planning and Monitoring of the Educational Process, the office of the registrar. Heads of educational programs on all majors are staff members.

There is a Commission on audit of Educational programs. This process includes checking the passport of the major, the competence card, the matrix (skill map), the forms for the modules, the Evaluation Funds.

In the process of conducting sociological surveys, students, teachers, employers give their suggestions.

The University takes an annual participation in the National rating of educational programs, where one of the criteria is the survey of employers.

3.6.6. Internal QA documents

All Regulations and Rules are approved by the Academic Council of the University and obligatory for compliance.

Regulations on professional practice for Bachelor students of KazUEFIT (2016, red3)

Regulations on professional practice of Master's degree students (2016, red3)

Regulation on the research practice of PhD students (2017)

3.6.7. Implementation of ESG Part 1

ESG PART 1	Yes	No	EVIDENCE

ESG 1.1

	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
Does the HEI have a policy to guarantee internally the quality	✓		- The strategy for development of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade - 2020 (2015, Edtion 2); - Academic policy of KazUEFIT (2017)
Does the institution promote quality culture?	✓		
If yes, is it made public and part of the HEI's strategic management?	✓		University internal documents are placed in the ARTA system storage, partly on the university website
If yes, does the HEI have appropriate structure and processes?	✓		Quality Control Department

ESG 1.2

	Yes	No	EVIDENCE
Does the HEI have processes for the design and approval of its programmes?	✓		- yes, in accordance with the Regulation on the modular construction of educational programs - meetings of Academic Councils - examinations on curriculums, Modular Educational Program (MEP) Education-al-methodological complexes

Does the HEI have official internal documents for ensuring programmes quality?			- KazUEFIT quality policy, - Quality objectives of KazUEFIT (updated annually) - Academic policy of KazUEFIT (2017) - documented procedures (planning of the educational process, educational and methodical work, quality control, etc.) - Regulation on the modular construction of educational programs (2017, Ed.N 3) - Regulations on Academic Councils of training programs (2017, revision 2) - Rules on Academic Integrity of students (2017) etc.
Are stakeholders involved in the design and approval of programmes?			- In order to improve the mechanisms of internal quality assessment and examination of educational programs, the Rector's order has established Academic Councils of educational programs (since 2013). The Academic Council concludes academic staff, employers, and students.

ESG 1.3

Are the pedagogical methods and methods of delivery assessed?			- Regulation on the audit of educational programs (2016) - Regulations on the system of assessing the knowledge of students on the development of MEP (2018)
Are the programmes delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process?			not enough
Are Flexible learning paths and different modes of delivery encouraged in the HEI?			not enough
The criteria for and method of assessment as well as criteria for marking are published in advance			Regulations on the design of the educational complex of the discipline (2017, Ed N 5) - Regulations on the system of assessing the knowledge of students on the development of MEP (2018)
Assessment is consistent, fairly applied to all students and carried out in accordance with the stated procedures;			-Regulation on the system of assessing the knowledge of students on the development of MEP (2018) -Regulation on anti-plagiarism (2016, Ed N 2) -Regulation on the final certification of students for undergraduate / graduate programs (2017, Ed N 2) - Regulation on testing technology for the state examinations on the final certification of students (2017, Ed N 2)

Is there a procedure for students appeals?			- Regulations on the Appeals Board (2018, Ed N 2) - Regulations on the Commission of Inquiry of KazUEFIT (2018)

ESG 1.4

Are there regulations for student admission?			Rules of admission at KazUEFIT on undergraduate programs (2018, revision 6) - Rules of admission at KazUEFIT on postgraduate education programs (.2018, red 5)
Are there regulations for student progression?			Not developed
Do students receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including achieved learning outcomes and the context, level, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed?			- student's guide - Student's Individual Education Program - transcript
Does HEI collects student's opinion on education quality? (questionnaires, surveys, feedbacks etc)			- KazUEFIT annually approves a plan for conducting student surveys. As part of the research, 6 types of questionnaires on students' satisfaction with the educational organization at KazUEFIT and to improve the educational process; on the quality of work of the faculty and faculty; on the organization and work practices, on the prevention and countering of corruption in KazUEFIT, etc.

ESG 1.5

Are the competences of teachers assessed?			- Regulations on the system of evaluation of the university faculty (2015) - Regulations on the assessment of professional competence of the faculty (2016) -conduct survey "Lecturer questionnaire" (annually) -work of the Competition Commission when applying for a job

Question			Documents
Are there fair and transparent proce-dures for the recruitment of staff?			- Rules of competitive filling of posts of teaching staff and scientists (2017, rev. 4) - Regulations for the selection and recruitment of personnel of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade (2018, red 2)
Do the University support teachers development?			- Regulations on the promotion of publication activity of faculty members (2016) - Regulations on the scientific school KazUEFIT (2017) - Regulation on the competition "The best head of the department" and the position on the competition "The best teacher" (2016, red 3) - Regulations on the Human Resources Commission (2016, rev. 2)

ESG 1.6

Question			Documents
Does the institution have appropriate and accessible funding for learning and teaching activities?			- Regulation on budgeting (2015, red 2) - Regulations on the wage system (2017) - Regulations on bonuses and payment of additional allowances of KazUEFIT employees (2015, red 2) - Regulations on business travel and representation expenses (2015, red2) -and etc.
Is student support provided when needed? And adapted to the student's needs?			- Regulation on the provision of educational benefits in the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade (2017). - Regulation on support for gifted students (2018) - Regulation on academic mobility for students (2017)

ESG 1.7

Question			Documents
Do the HEI collect analyses and use relevant information for the management of the institution?			

ESG 1.8

Question			Documents
Do the HEI publish clear, accurate and objective information on its activities and programmes?			- Annual report of the rector (on the website) - Orientation work in schools, colleges of the city and the region -information about the work of the university in the media (speech on TV, publications in newspapers, on the page of the university website)

ESG 1.9

Are there regular monitoring and reviews of study programmes?			- Regulation on the audit of educational programs (2016)
Are the study programmes reviewed and modified?			- Regulations on the international educational program of "double degree" of the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade and foreign partner universities (2014) - Regulations on guest lectures (2017)
Does this process of monitoring and revision include students?			as part of the Audit Commission for Educational Programs

ESG 1.10

Does your institution undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis?			- Regulations on the procedure for transferring training courses and credits by type of ECTS in KazUEFIT (.2017, Ed N 3) - Regulations on the procedure for execution and issuance of the European Diploma Supplement (.2016)

3.6.8. Conclusions

It is necessary to:

— Strengthen the internal system of quality assurance;

— Continue further modernization of the educational and methodological support of the educational process;

— Make further efforts to improve distance learning technologies, develop their own mass open online courses (MOOC), create e-educational content;

— Organize schools of pedagogical innovations, young lecturer, pedagogical skills;

— On a regular basis, conduct trainings and seminars (webinars) for faculty members

— Complete the implementation of the automated information

system "E-university", thereby improving the IT activities of the University.

— Reorganization of the Quality Control Department into the Quality Assurance Department.

edu
qas

**ANALYSIS
OF PARTNER COUNTRIES QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEMS
IN THE CONTEXT OF WP1
"THE OVERVIEW OF EU&PC QA POLICY STRATEGY
ON NATIONAL AND INSTITUTIONAL LEVELS"**